

# Commentary on candidate C

The evidence for this candidate has achieved the following marks for each question of this question paper.

## Scottish Context; Part A – The Wars of Independence, 1286-1328

### Question 1: Explain the reasons why the succession of Margret, Maid of Norway, caused problems for Scotland after 1286. (6 marks)

- ◆ First sentence is a **process** sentence.
- ◆ Next sentence is an **accurate relevant reason (MI 7)** credited for no direct heir '*...heir to the Scottish throne.*' **Process** is evident at the beginning of the sentence.
- ◆ Another **accurate relevant reason (MI 2)** credited in the next sentence for the Margaret being female up to '*...lead the troops in battle.*' **Process** is evident at the beginning of the sentence.
- ◆ The next sentence is an **accurate relevant reason (MI 1)** credited for Margaret being a child up to '*...couldn't lead the country.*' **Process** is evident at the beginning of the sentence.
- ◆ An **accurate relevant reason (MI 5)** credited in the next sentence for Margaret being foreign up to '*...lived in Scotland before.*' **Process** is evident at the beginning of the sentence.
- ◆ The next sentence is an **accurate relevant reason (MI 3)** given for issues with her marriage up to '*...take over Scotland.*' **Process** is evident at the beginning of the sentence.

The last sentence is credited for **developing an accurate relevant reason (MI 3)** given for issues with her marriage to Scottish nobles up to '*...between the Scottish nobles.*' **Process** is evident at the beginning of the sentence.

<b>Accurate relevant reason</b>	= 6/6 marks including 1 developed point
<b>Total</b>	= 6/6 marks

### Question 2: How fully does source A describe the events that led to the defeat and capture of John Balliol? (6 marks)

- ◆ **A judgement** is in the first sentence of the answer '*Source A does not fully describe...*'
- ◆ The next sentence is credited for **identifying a point from the source in support of the judgement** given for John withdrawing fealty to Edward up to '*...should be withdrawn.*'
- ◆ **Identifying a point from the source in support of the judgement** credited for the next sentence for making a treaty with France up to '*...treaty with France.*'
- ◆ The next sentence is also credited for **identifying a point from the source in support of the judgement** given for the Scots invading England up to '*...invaded England.*'
- ◆ The next paragraph starts with credit for **identifying a point of significant omission (MI 8)** given for chasing Balliol to the north up to '*...through Scotland.*'
- ◆ The next sentence is **credited identifying a point of significant omission (MI 9)** given for the Capture of Balliol up to '*...captured Balliol in Montrose.*'
- ◆ **Identifying a point of significant omission (MI 10)** credited for the last sentence about stripping Balliol of his tabard and imprisoning him up to '*...in the Tower of London.*'

Source	= 3/3 marks
Omissions	= 3/4 marks
<b>Total</b>	= 6/6 marks

**Question 3: To what extent were the mistakes made by the English the most important reason why the Scots won the Battle of Stirling Bridge in 1297? (9 marks)**

- ◆ First sentence credited for **outlining relevant factors**. **Process** is clear at the beginning of the sentence.
- ◆ First sentence of the next paragraph starts with **process** then is credited **knowledge used to support the factor (MI 7)** for Cressingham sending his troops over the bridge up to '*...knights over the Bridge.*'
- ◆ The next paragraph is given no credit as it is too vague.
- ◆ **Balance** is introduced in the first sentence of the next paragraph and credited **knowledge used to support the factor (MI 8)** for the next sentence for the point about the size of Stirling Bridge up to '*...slowed the English attack down.*' **Process** at the beginning of the paragraph.
- ◆ The next sentence is credited **knowledge used to support the factor (MI 11)** for developing this point about the English cavalry on the marshy ground up to '*...made them sink.*'
- ◆ **A judgement** is in the beginning of the conclusion up to '*...won the battle of Stirling bridge*'
- ◆ A **supported reason** credited up to the end of the conclusion.

Knowledge	= 3/5 marks
Structure	= 1/1 marks for introduction outlining relevant factors
	= 1/1 marks for organising into different factors
	= 1/1 marks for judgement
	= 1/1 marks for a reason supporting the judgement
<b>Total</b>	<b>= 7/9 marks</b>

**Question 4: Evaluate the usefulness of Source B as evidence of the methods used by King Robert to drive the English out of Scotland between 1307 and 1314. (5 marks)**

- ◆ First sentence is a **process** sentence.
- ◆ **Evaluative comment relating to a point of content of the source** credited for taking the castle with ladders up to the end of the first paragraph '*...which makes the source more useful.*' **Process** is clear at the end of the paragraph.
- ◆ The next paragraph has an **evaluative comment relating to a point of content of the source** credited for the comment on laying siege to Perth '*...which makes the source more useful.*' **Process** is clear in the last sentence of the paragraph.
- ◆ **Evaluative comment relating to the type of source** credited for the accuracy of the chronicle up to '*... makes the source more useful.*' **Process** is clear at the end of the sentence.

Provenance	= 1/4 mark
Content	= 2/2 marks
Omissions	= 0/2 marks
<b>Total</b>	<b>= 3/5 marks</b>

**Section total = 22 marks out of 26**

## British Context; Part E – The Making of Modern Britain, 1880-1951

### Question 41: Explain the reasons why many people believed some groups of the poor deserved to be helped before 1914. (6 marks)

- ◆ First sentence is a **process** sentence.
- ◆ Next sentence credited as an **accurate relevant reason (MI 7)** for sick unable to earn up to '*...or earn money.*' **Process** is evident at the beginning of the sentence.
- ◆ The next sentence is credited as an **accurate relevant reason (MI 4)** for children unable to work up to '*...go to school.*' **Process** is evident at the beginning of the sentence.
- ◆ The next sentence is credited as an **accurate relevant reason (MI 5)** for the old being unable to work up to '*...clothing and housing.*' **Process** is evident at the beginning of the sentence.
- ◆ The last sentence is credited as an **accurate relevant reason (MI 11)** given for widows unable to survive up to '*...look after the children.*' **Process** is evident at the beginning of the sentence.

Accurate relevant reasons = 4/6 marks  
**Total = 4/6 marks**

### Question 42: To what extent were free school meals the most successful of the Liberal reforms for the young? (9 marks)

- ◆ First sentence credited for **outlining relevant factors.** **Process** is clear at the beginning of the sentence.
- ◆ Next paragraph starts with two sentences that are credited **knowledge used to support the factor (MI 2)** given for the success of free school meals up to '*...received free school meals.*' **Process** at the end of the second sentence
- ◆ The next sentence is credited **knowledge used to support the factor (MI 4)** for the compulsory nature of the reforms up to the end of the paragraph '*...free school meals to poor children.*'
- ◆ **Balance** is provided in the first sentence of the next paragraph as a new factor is introduced up to '*...a very successful reform.*'
- ◆ The next sentence is credited **knowledge used to support the factor (MI 12)** for the success of the Children's Charter up to '*...kids begging in the street.*' **Process** clear throughout the sentence.
- ◆ A **judgement** credited in the conclusion for a conclusion up to '*...the most successful ... reform*'
- ◆ The rest of the sentence offers a valid reason **in support of the judgement** up to the end of the paragraph.

Knowledge = 3/5 marks  
 Structure = 1/1 marks for introduction factors  
                   = 1/1 marks for offering balance with different factors  
                   = 1/1 marks for judgement  
                   = 1/1 marks for a reason supporting the judgement  
**Total = 7/9 marks**

### Question 43: Compare the views of Sources B and C about the benefits of the 1911 National Insurance Act. (4 marks)

- ◆ **Overall comparison** given for the first sentence up to '*...the benefits of the 1911 National Insurance Act.*'

- ◆ **Simple comparison** credited for the next sentence up to '*...you would get free health care.*'
- ◆ **Developed comparison** for the next sentence up to '*...provided with free medical care.*'
- ◆ **Simple comparison** credited for the next sentence up to '*...paid if you have a baby.*'
- ◆ **Developed comparison** given for second point of comparison. Development comes at the beginning of the sentence with the sources agreeing that women got maternity benefits. The comparison highlights this up to '*...a grant of 30 shillings.*'

Overall comparison	= 1 mark
Simple comparison	= 2/3 marks
Developed Comparison	= 2/3 marks
<b>Total</b>	<b>= 4/4 marks</b>

**Question 44: How fully does Source C explain why the Second World War helped to bring about a welfare state? (6 marks)**

- ◆ There is a **judgement** in the first paragraph with the sentence starting '*Source C does not fully explain...*'
- ◆ The first sentence of the next paragraph is **identifying a point from the source in support of the judgement** and is credited for WW2 creating a sense of community up to '*...determined to create a better Britain.*'
- ◆ **Identifying a point from the source in support of the judgement** credited for the Ministry of Food up to '*...a fair share of food.*'
- ◆ Another **identifying a point from the source in support of the judgement** credited for the last sentence of the paragraph on family allowance up to '*...family allowance were also introduced.*'
- ◆ The first sentence of the next paragraph is credited for **identifying a point of significant omission (MI 5)** for the point about evacuation up to '*...especially to help city children.*'
- ◆ The next is sentence is credited for **identifying a point of significant omission (MI 6)** given for the point about bombings up to '*...needed a National Health service.*'
- ◆ No credit given for the last sentence as it does not explain why the Second World War helped bring about the welfare state.

Source	= 3/3 marks
Omissions	= 2/4 mark
<b>Total</b>	<b>= 5/6 marks</b>

**Question 45: Describe the Labour reforms which improved the lives of the poor between 1945 and 1951. (4 marks)**

- ◆ The first sentence is a **process** sentence.
- ◆ The next sentence gains credit an **accurate relevant point (5)** for the introduction of the NHS up to '*...the NHS was created.*'
- ◆ **A developed accurate relevant point (MI 5)** credited for the benefits NHS up to '*...and many more benefits.*'
- ◆ The sentence starting '*Also, in 1946 the Butlers Education Act...*' is given credit because it is an **accurate relevant point (any other relevant point)** that the school leaving age was raised to 15 and the education system reorganised, largely as a result of the work done by Ellen Wilkinson, Education Minister.
- ◆ An **accurate relevant point (MI 8)** credited for the last sentence on the New Towns Act up to '*...reduce overcrowding.*'

Accurate relevant point	= 4/4 marks
-------------------------	-------------

**Total = 4/4 marks**

**Section total = 24 marks out of 29**

## European and World Context; Part G - Free at Last? Civil Rights in the USA, 1918-1968

**Question 76: Describe the difficulties faced by immigrants to the USA in the 1920s. (4 marks)**

- ◆ The first sentence is a **process** sentence.
- ◆ An **accurate relevant point (MI 3)** credited in the next sentence for the point about overcrowded housing up to '*...was major overcrowding.*'
- ◆ A **developed accurate relevant point (MI 3)** credited for the next sentence about difficulty caused by disease up to '*...diseases being spread.*'
- ◆ An **accurate relevant point (MI 9)** credited for the next sentence about rats up to '*...lived in the immigrant housing.*'
- ◆ The last sentence is an **accurate relevant point (MI 6)** credited for the levels of poverty up to '*...a huge amount of money.*'

Accurate relevant points = 4/4 marks

**Total = 4/4 marks**

**Question 77: Evaluate the usefulness of source A as evidence of the ways in which the Jim Crow laws segregated black and white Americans. (6 marks)**

- ◆ The first sentence is a **process** sentence.
- ◆ **Evaluative comment relating to a point of content of the source** given for the separate education system up to '*...makes the source more useful.*' **Process** is credited for the first sentence.
- ◆ **Evaluative comment relating to a point of content of the source** given for the segregated employment system up to the end of the paragraph '*...makes the source more useful.*' **Process** is clear in the last sentence.
- ◆ **Evaluative comment relating to a point of significant omission (MI 4)** given for the segregated public toilets up to '*...makes the source less useful.*' **Process** is clear in the last part of the sentence.
- ◆ This **evaluative comment relating to a point of significant omission (MI 4)** is **developed** and receives further credit up to the end of the paragraph '*...which makes the source less useful.*'
- ◆ **Evaluative comment relating to the timing of the source** credited for date and benefit of hindsight up to '*...makes the source more useful.*' **Process** is clear in the last part of the sentence.
- ◆ **Evaluative comment relating to the purpose of the source** given for textbook and research up to '*...makes the source more useful.*' **Process** is clear in the last part of the sentence.

Provenance = 2/4 marks

Content = 2/2 marks

Omissions = 2/2 marks

**Total = 5/5 marks**

**Question 78: Explain the reasons why sit-ins were an important step forward in the campaign for civil rights. (6 marks)**

- ◆ The first sentence is a **process** sentence.
- ◆ An **accurate relevant reason (MI 2)** credited for the success of the sit-ins up to '*...were desegregated.*' **Process** is clear at the beginning of the sentence.

- ◆ An **accurate relevant reason (MI 1)** credited for black and white Americans joining together up to '*...together for desegregation.*' **Process** is clear at the beginning of the sentence.
- ◆ An **accurate relevant reason (MI 5)** credited for the creation of the SNCC up to '*...SNCC were created.*' **Process** is clear at the beginning of the sentence.
- ◆ A **development of an accurate relevant reason (MI 5)** credited for other protests the SNCC were involved in up to '*in Birmingham in 1963.*'
- ◆ An **accurate relevant reason (MI 4)** credited for the publicity generated up to '*...for the civil rights campaign.*' **Process** is clear at the beginning of the sentence.
- ◆ An **accurate relevant reason (MI 8)** credited for the numbers involved up to '*...the federal government.*' **Process** is clear at the beginning of the sentence.
- ◆ A **development of an accurate relevant reason (MI 2)** credited for the numbers involved in up to '*...+ the federal government.*'

Accurate relevant reason = 6/6 marks

**Total = 6/6 marks**

### Question 79: How fully does Source B describe the civil rights protest in Birmingham in 1963? (6 marks)

- ◆ There is a **judgement** in the first paragraph with '*Source B does not fully describe...*'
- ◆ **Identifying a point from the source in support of the judgement** credited first sentence of the next paragraph up to '*...the march was led by students*'
- ◆ **Identifying a point from the source in support of the judgement** credited for Bull Connor arresting many up to '*...arrested many protestors.*'
- ◆ **Identifying a point from the source in support of the judgement** credited in the next paragraph for the use of water cannon up to '*...used against the marchers.*'
- ◆ **Identifying a point of significant omission (MI 6)** credited for the use of dogs up to '*...to attack the marchers.*'
- ◆ No credit given for the last two sentences as they are considered too vague.

Source = 3/3 marks

Omissions = 1/4 mark

**Total = 4/6 marks**

### Question 80: Compare the views of Sources C and D about the beliefs of Malcolm X. (4 marks)

- ◆ **Overall comparison** credited for the first sentence about the overall disagreement.
- ◆ **Simple comparison** for the next sentence up to '*...hated white Americans.*'
- ◆ **Developed comparison** given for the development of this comparison up to '*...didn't hate white Americans.*'
- ◆ **Simple comparison** for the next sentence up to '*...that blacks were superior*'
- ◆ **Developed comparison** given for the development of this comparison up to '*...superior to anyone else.*'

Overall comparison = 1 mark

Simple comparison = 2/3 marks

Developed comparison = 2/3 marks

**Total = 4/4 marks**

**Section total = 23 marks out of 25**

**Total for paper = 69 out of 80**