

# Commentary on candidate B

The evidence for this candidate has achieved the following marks for each question of this question paper.

## Scottish Context; Part E – The Era of the Great War, 1900-1928

### Question 17: To what extent was the machine gun the most effective weapon on the Western Front during the Great War? (9 marks)

- ◆ First sentence credited for **outlining relevant factors**. **Process** comes at the end of the sentence
- ◆ **Knowledge used to support the factor (MI 1)** credited for first sentence about the range of the machine gun up to ‘...*damage on the opponent.*’
- ◆ No credit for the next sentence as it is inaccurate.
- ◆ The last sentence of the paragraph is a repetition of previous points.
- ◆ First sentence of the next paragraph introduces a new factor and **balance** with **process**.
- ◆ **Knowledge used to support the factor (MI 5)** credited for the point about tanks up to ‘...*trenches and bunkers.*’ **Process** comes in previous sentence.
- ◆ **Knowledge used to support the factor (MI 6)** credited for the next sentence about the armour of the tank up to ‘...*armour and plating of the vehicle.*’
- ◆ **Developed point used to support the factor (MI 6)** credited for the point about the infantry support role of the tank up to ‘...*to cross no man’s land.*’
- ◆ **Knowledge used to support the factor (MI 7)** credited for the point about the limitations of the tank up to the end of the paragraph ‘...*got stuck in the mud.*’
- ◆ **A judgement** awarded in the conclusion up to ‘...*during the Great War.*’
- ◆ No credit for the reason in support of the judgement as it is inaccurate

|              |   |
|--------------|---|
| Knowledge    | = 5/5 marks including 1 developed point           |
| Structure    | = 1/1 mark for introduction                       |
|              | = 1/1 mark for organising into different factors. |
|              | = 1/1 mark for judgement                          |
|              | = 0/1 mark for a reason supporting the judgement  |
| <b>Total</b> | <b>= 8/9 marks</b>                                |

### Question 18: How fully does source A describe the restrictions introduced under the Defence of the realm Act? (6 marks)

- ◆ A **judgement** is in the first sentence of the answer with ‘*Source A describes...to a certain extent.*’
- ◆ Credit given for **identifying a point from the source in support of the judgement** for not being able to talk about the military up to ‘...*army in public.*’
- ◆ Credit given for **identifying a point from the source in support of the judgement** for not being able to spread rumours up to ‘...*military or their decisions.*’
- ◆ Credit given for **identifying a point from the source in support of the judgement** for introduction of daylight hours up to ‘...*encourage more working hours.*’
- ◆ No credit given for the point on propaganda because it was censorship that was introduced under the Act.
- ◆ The next sentence is credited with identifying a **point of significant other omission** for point on aliens up to ‘...*were usually followed and labelled aliens.*’
- ◆ No credit given for the point on conscription because it was not introduced by DORA.

|              |                    |
|--------------|--------------------|
| Source       | = 3/3 marks        |
| Omissions    | = 1/4 marks        |
| <b>Total</b> | <b>= 4/6 marks</b> |

**Question 19: Evaluate the usefulness of source B as evidence of women's work during the Great War. (5 marks)**

- ◆ First sentence is a **process** sentence.
- ◆ Next two sentences of evaluative comment relating to the content of the source are not given credit as in the first point there is no evaluation of its usefulness and in the second, the source is misquoted.
- ◆ **Evaluative comment relating to a point of significant omission (MI 2)** credited for women war work up to '*...worked in factories and farms.*'
- ◆ **Evaluative comment relating to a point of significant omission (MI 5)** credited for women working as mechanics up to '*...RAF during the Great War.*'
- ◆ No credit given for the comment relating to the author of the source as there is no evident process, ie explanation of why being Prime Minister would be important.
- ◆ **Evaluative comment relating to a point of purpose of the source** credited for the comment about the source informing about women's war work at the time '*...showing the women's work.*' **Process** is evident throughout the sentence.
- ◆ No credit given for the rest of the answer as it does not provide an appropriate evaluative comment.

|              |                    |
|--------------|--------------------|
| Provenance   | = 1/4 marks        |
| Content      | = 0/2 marks        |
| Omissions    | = 2/2 marks        |
| <b>Total</b> | <b>= 3/5 marks</b> |

**Question 20: Explain the reasons why the Suffragettes harmed the cause of votes for women. (6 marks)**

- ◆ Process sentence at the beginning of the answer.
- ◆ An **accurate relevant reason (MI 1)** credited for the two sentences about the tactics of the Suffragettes up to '*...unfit for voting.*' **Process** comes at the end of the answer.

|                          |                    |
|--------------------------|--------------------|
| Accurate relevant reason | = 1/6 marks        |
| <b>Total</b>             | <b>= 1/6 marks</b> |

**Section total = 16 marks out of 26**

## British Context; Part E – The Making of Modern Britain, 1880-1951

**Question 41: Explain the reasons why many people believed some groups of the poor deserved to be helped before 1914. (6 marks)**

- ◆ The first sentence is a **process** sentence.
- ◆ No credit for the next two sentences as the discussion do not meet the aims of the question.
- ◆ **An accurate relevant reason (MI 1)** credited for the next sentence up to '*...within those in poverty.*'
- ◆ No credit for the rest of the answer as it fails to meet the aims of the question, ie clearly explaining why many people believed groups of the poor should be helped.

Accurate relevant reasons = 1/6 marks  
**Total = 1/6 marks**

**Question 42: To what extent were free school meals the most successful of the Liberal reforms for the young? (9 marks)**

- ◆ First sentence credited for **outlining relevant factors**.
- ◆ First sentence of the next paragraph credited **knowledge used to support the factor (MI 1)** for the opportunity to deliver free school meals up to '*...to prevent malnutrition.*' **Process** comes at the beginning of the sentence.
- ◆ **Knowledge used to support the factor (MI 2)** is credited the next two sentences about the lack of payment needed to receive this up to '*...under the free schools meal act.*'
- ◆ **Balance** is introduced with a new factor and **knowledge used to support the factor (MI 9)** for the Children's Charter up to '*...death penalty was abolished.*' **Process** is clear at the beginning of the sentence.
- ◆ **Knowledge used to support the factor (MI 11)** credited for the Children's Charter introducing home inspections up to '*...house was safe for children.*' **Process** at the end of the sentence.
- ◆ The next two sentences about payment to parents not credited because it is inaccurate and not relevant to the question.
- ◆ **A judgement** is awarded in the conclusion.

Knowledge = 4/5 marks  
 Structure = 1/1 mark for introduction  
                   = 1/1 mark for balance with different factors.  
                   = 1/1 marks for judgement  
                   = 0/1 mark for a reason supporting the judgement  
**Total = 7/9 marks**

**Question 43: Compare the views of Sources B and C about the benefits of the 1911 National Insurance Act. (4 marks)**

- ◆ Overall comparison credited for the first sentence up to '*...the benefits of the 1911 National Insurance Act.*'
- ◆ **Simple comparison** credited up to '*...medical care for free.*'
- ◆ **Developed comparison** credited for developing the comparison about being insured and receiving health benefits up to '*...provided with free medical care.*' Development comes at the beginning of the comparison.
- ◆ **Simple comparison** credited for second point of comparison up to '*...were given 30 shillings.*'
- ◆ **Developed comparison** credited for developing the comparison about receiving maternity benefit up to '*...were given a grant of 30 shillings.*'

|                      |                    |
|----------------------|--------------------|
| Overall comparison   | = 1 mark           |
| Simple comparison    | = 2/3 marks        |
| Developed Comparison | = 2/3 marks        |
| <b>Total</b>         | <b>= 4/4 marks</b> |

**Question 44: How fully does Source C explain why the Second World War helped to bring about a welfare state? (6 marks)**

- ◆ **A judgement** is made in the first paragraph with '*Source C explains...to a fair extent...*'
- ◆ Next sentence is credited for **identifying a point from the source in support of the judgement** as it states that World War 2 created a sense of community up to '*...included everyone in Britain.*'
- ◆ **Identifying a point from the source in support of the judgement** credited for the sentence on the Government becoming a large part of peoples' lives up to '*...done a lot already.*'
- ◆ **Identifying a point from the source in support of the judgement** credited for the introduction of rationing up to '*...and made people feel equal.*'
- ◆ No credit for the next sentence as it is vague.
- ◆ The next sentence is credited for **identifying a point of significant omission (MI 7)** given for the Beveridge report up to '*...in order to tackle them.*'
- ◆ **Identifying a point of significant omission (MI 5)** credited for the last sentence pointing out the effects of evacuation up to '*...made people want a welfare state.*'

|              |                    |
|--------------|--------------------|
| Source       | = 3/3 marks        |
| Omissions    | = 2/4 mark         |
| <b>Total</b> | <b>= 5/6 marks</b> |

**Question 45: Describe the Labour reforms which improved the lives of the poor between 1945 and 1951. (4 marks)**

- ◆ First sentence is an introductory sentence.
- ◆ An **accurate relevant point (MI 5)** credited on the introduction of prescriptions up to '*...exceeded the initial statistics.*'
- ◆ The next sentence is an **accurate relevant point all (MI 8)** credited for the New Towns act up to '*...towns like Cumbernauld.*'
- ◆ The next sentence is another **accurate relevant point (MI 3)** for the introduction of the National Insurance Act up to '*...not just the workers*'.
- ◆ No credit for the next sentence on the removal of means testing because it is inaccurate.
- ◆ The sentence starting '*The reformed education system...*' is given credit because it is an **accurate relevant point (any other relevant point)** that the school leaving age was raised to 15, largely as a result of the work done by Ellen Wilkinson, Education Minister.
- ◆ The last sentence is an **accurate relevant point (MI 2)** credited for the reform of pensions up to '*...more money to people.*'

|                          |                    |
|--------------------------|--------------------|
| Accurate relevant points | = 4/4 marks        |
| <b>Total</b>             | <b>= 4/4 marks</b> |

**Section total = 21 marks out of 29**

## European and World Context; Part E – Red Flag: Lenin and the Russian revolution, 1894-1921.

**Question 66: Describe the methods used by the Tsar to control the Russian people. (4 marks)**

- ◆ The first sentence is a **process** sentence.
- ◆ **Accurate relevant point (MI 5)** credited for the point the control of the Orthodox Church up to '*...the divine ruler of Russia.*'
- ◆ **Accurate relevant point (MI 4)** credited for the use of the army up to '*...prevented any rebellions.*'
- ◆ **Accurate relevant point (MI 2)** credited for the role of the Okhrana up to '*...speaking against the Tsar.*'
- ◆ **Accurate relevant point (MI 7)** credited for the point the control by the Civil Service up to '*...did not threaten his control.*'

Accurate relevant point = 4/4 marks

**Total = 4/4 marks**

**Question 67: How fully does Source A describe the events of the 1905 Revolution? (6 marks)**

- ◆ A **judgement** in the first sentence with '*Source A describes...briefly but it misses out.....*'
- ◆ The next sentence is credited **identifying a point from the source in support of the judgement** for the numbers involved in protesting up to '*...protested in Russia.*'
- ◆ The next sentence is credited **identifying a point from the source in support of the judgement** given for the assassination of the Tsar's uncle up to '*...assassinated during the revolution.*'
- ◆ The next sentence is also credited **identifying a point from the source in support of the judgement** given minorities rising up against the Tsar up to '*...to fight against the Tsar.*'
- ◆ No credit given for the next sentence regarding strikes as it comes from the source.
- ◆ **Identifying a point of significant omission (MI 10)** is credited for peasants rising up against the Tsar up to '*...rebel against the Tsar.*'
- ◆ The last sentence is credited for **identifying a point of significant omission (MI 8)** for the railway strikes up to '*...out of order by the rebellions.*'

Source = 3/3 marks

Omissions = 2/4 mark

**Total = 5/6 marks**

**Question 68: Explain the reasons why the February Revolution broke out in 1917. (6 marks)**

- ◆ First sentence is a **process** sentence.
- ◆ No credit is given for the next sentence as the knowledge is not relevant to the reasons for the February Revolution in 1917.
- ◆ No credit is given for the next sentence on famine as it is a little vague and this is credited later in the answer.
- ◆ No credit is given for the next sentence on people protesting as it is not clearly linked to the question asked.
- ◆ **Accurate relevant reason (MI 2)** credited for the sentences about the Tsar commanding the army up to '*...point the blame at.*' **Process** clear throughout.

- ◆ **Accurate relevant reason (MI 6)** credited for the next two sentences about the reliance on Rasputin up to '*...did not like her.*' **Process** clear throughout.
- ◆ The last two sentences are credited for the same **accurate relevant reason (MI 1)** about economic issues up to '*...the Tsar and the situation.*' **Process** clear throughout.

Accurate relevant reason = 3/6 marks  
**Total = 3/6 marks**

**Question 69: Evaluate the usefulness of source B as evidence of the reasons for the failure of the Provisional Government. (6 marks)**

- ◆ The first sentence is a **process** sentence.
- ◆ No credit is given for the evaluative comment relating to the content of the source about land problems not being fixed because the candidate has paraphrased and missed the full source point.
- ◆ The next two sentences credited an **evaluative comment relating to a point of significant omission (MI 1)** on the Soviets having control of the army up to '*...did not mention important factors.*' **Process** is clear in the second sentence.
- ◆ No credit is given for the evaluative comment relating to the purpose as it is vague.
- ◆ **Evaluative comment relating to the author of the source** credited up to '*...written with hindsight.*' **Process** clear throughout the sentence.
- ◆ No credit is given for the evaluative comment relating to the type of source.
- ◆ **Evaluative comment relating to the author of the source** credited for the accuracy of the author up to the end of the answer '*...done by a specialist.*' **Process** is clear throughout the sentence.

Provenance = 2/4 marks  
 Content = 0/2 marks  
 Recall = 1/2 marks  
**Total = 3/5 marks**

**Question 70: Compare the views of Sources C and D about the effects of the Civil War on Russian peasants. (4 marks)**

- ◆ Overall comparison given for the first sentence about the overall disagreement.

Overall comparison = 1 mark  
**Total = 1/4 mark**

**Section total = 16 marks out of 25**

**Total for paper = 53 out of 80**