

Commentary on candidate evidence

The evidence for these candidates has achieved the following marks for each question of question paper 2.

Candidate 1

Section 1 – Scottish text: *Tally's Blood* by Ann Marie di Mambro

The candidate was awarded **15 out of 20 marks** for this section.

Question 9

The candidate was awarded **1 out of 2 marks** for this question.

The candidate was given **1 mark** for ‘work late nights,’ because although the word ‘work’ is lifted from the extract, it is qualified by ‘late nights,’ and is therefore acceptable.

‘Work to earn their living’ was not an indication of any further understanding – more detail is required, along the lines of ‘hardworking’, or ‘strong work ethic,’ etc. The remainder of the candidate’s response relies too heavily on words lifted from the extract (‘jobs,’ ‘together,’ pay,'); therefore no further marks were awarded.

Question 10

The candidate was awarded **2 out of 2 marks** for this question.

‘(Massimo)...wants to leave’ was awarded **1 mark**, essentially for ‘wants to leave.’ The candidate specified that Massimo wants to ‘go to Italy,’ but this is a lift from the extract.

The candidate was also given **1 mark** for ‘while he is still free’. The candidate turns to Rosinella, and offers more material; however, full marks have already been achieved. The comment that Rosinella ‘didn’t want to lose it’ would have been worth 1 mark, as would (Massimo) ‘is worried,’ and ‘Massimo is a very likeable person.’

Question 11

The candidate was awarded **4 out of 4 marks** for this question.

The candidate was given **1 mark** for the reference ‘Now I feel like I’ve got nowhere.’ The accompanying comment ‘indicates he feels down’ was awarded **1 mark**. It is worth noting that ‘upset’ would also have been worth 1 mark.

The candidate’s second reference ‘I went to school here...buried here’ was given **1 mark**.

The comment ‘his whole life has been here’ was awarded **1 mark** for the idea of belonging to Scotland. The alternative comments ‘memories here,’ and ‘doesn’t want to leave’ would also have been acceptable.

Question 12

The candidate was awarded **4 out of 4 marks** for this question.

The candidate was awarded **1 mark** for the correct reference ‘cowering’ ('threatened' would also have been acceptable). The comment ‘it’s relating to how Massimo is feeling. He’s...scared of war’ was given **1 mark**.

The candidate’s second reference ‘I don’t like this game’ was awarded **1 mark**. The comment ‘it shows that Hughie and Lucia both would be very frightened by war’ was also given **1 mark**. Although the two comments are similar, there is sufficient difference in that the first one relates to Massimo, and the second one to the children.

Question 13

The candidate was awarded **4 out of 8 marks** for this question.

Commonality

In the first paragraph, the candidate provides material which is then repeated later. A judgement had to be made on where to allocate the marks. As the candidate’s later material had slightly more detail, it was decided that marks should be awarded there. For this reason, **0 marks** were awarded for ‘commonality’.

Extract

The candidate was given **1 mark** for ‘Italy is coming to war.’ The comment ‘Massimo is expressing concern...about war happening’ was also awarded **1 mark**.

Elsewhere

The candidate was awarded **1 mark** for ‘Massimo gets taken away’ ('to fight in the war' is incorrect).

The comment ‘even though Massimo is scared of war he’s still got to go’ was also given **1 mark**.

Section 2 – Critical essay

The candidate was awarded **11 marks**.

Summary

The candidate has chosen to write about the short story *On the Sidewalk Bleeding* by Evan Hunter, in response to question 4 from the prose section. The

candidate states: 'In this essay I will discuss ways in which I feel sympathy for Andy' (the main character of the story).

Understanding/relevance

There is some familiarity with the text as a whole, which is shown through the candidate's discussion of Andy's relationship with Laura, his involvement with the gang, the significance of the jacket, and his realisation that he would die.

There is some understanding of the central concerns of the text, with discussion of the impact of gang membership on Andy's life:

"If he died, he died Andy not a Royal." This quote shows that once Andy had been stabbed and was left dying he realised that being part of "The Royals" got him killed not because he was Andy' (paragraph 2).

There is no doubt about the relevance of the response as each paragraph begins with reference to the words of the question (to the point of being repetitive). All paragraphs contain reasons why the candidate feels sympathy for Andy. These include: 'nobody would help him' (paragraph 2), 'it was the gang's name not him they wanted to stab' (paragraph 2), 'now he had no chance of marrying her (Laura)' (paragraph 3). Some of this again becomes repetitive, especially in relation to Andy's realisation about his own death.

Analysis/evaluation

There is an awareness of the writer's techniques, mostly plot (the candidate outlines some of the main events), and the characterisation of Andy, eg 'he was proud to be in the Royals but now it meant nothing' (paragraph 4).

In terms of evaluation, there is some commentary of what has been enjoyed/gained from the text. The candidate's engagement with the text can be seen in comments such as:

'It makes me feel sympathy for him as he was only 16 but he knew Laura was the love of his life. Now he had no chance of marrying her' (paragraph 3).

Structure/accuracy

The candidate communicates a line of thought at first reading and uses spelling, grammar and punctuation with sufficient accuracy.

Overall

The candidate displays some familiarity with the text as a whole, showing some understanding of the central concerns. There is an awareness of the writer's techniques (plot and characterisation), and there is some commentary of what has been enjoyed/gained. The essay is described by the statements in the 13-10 mark range, and it was awarded a mark from the middle of the range – 11 marks, its relevance off-setting thinness of analysis.

Overall, this candidate was awarded 26/40 marks for the National 5 Critical Reading question paper.

Candidate 2

Section 1 – Scottish text: *The Way My Mother Speaks* by Carol Ann Duffy

The candidate was awarded **20 out of 20 marks** for this section.

Question 36

The candidate was awarded **2 out of 2 marks** for this question.

The reference ‘under the shallows of my breath’ was awarded **1 mark**.

The appropriate comment ‘to calm her’ was also given **1 mark**.

The candidate has now achieved maximum marks for this question, but the further commentary on ‘shallows’ would also have been acceptable.

Question 37

The candidate was awarded **4 out of 4 marks** for this question.

The reference ‘too blue swapped for a cool grey’ was awarded **1 mark**. The comment ‘Blue suggests bright and clam whereas grey represents discomfort and uncertainty’ was also given **1 mark**.

The next reference offered by the candidate was awarded **1 mark**: ‘Nothing is silent. Nothing is not silent.’ The comment ‘This is a contradiction and emphasises...she is unsure about the journey’ was given **1 mark**.

It is worth noting that the candidate’s further comment ‘This suggests she is unsettled by the move’ would not have gained a mark because the word ‘unsettling’ is in the question.

Question 38

The candidate was awarded **4 out of 4 marks** for this question.

The first reference offered by the candidate: ‘I am happy and sad like a child’ is an acceptable reference, but the accompanying comment: ‘she begins to show maturity this shows her emotions’ is too imprecise. However, the candidate offers more material. The reference ‘green’ was awarded **1 mark**, and a further **1 mark** was given for the comment ‘shows naivety.’ The reference ‘erotic pond’ was awarded **1 mark**, and the comment ‘growing awareness of her sexuality’ was also given **1 mark**.

Question 39

The candidate was awarded **2 out of 2 marks** for this question.

The candidate was awarded **1 mark** for ‘she misses her family,’ and **1 mark** for ‘in some sense feels liberated’.

Further material offered, about always remembering her mother’s voice, would also have been acceptable.

Question 40

The candidate was awarded **8 out of 8 marks** for this question.

Commonality

The candidate identifies the idea of change in *The Way My Mother Speaks*: ‘Change is explored in the way my mother speaks by Duffy growing from childhood to adulthood.’ This was awarded **1 mark**.

The candidate then goes on to identify change in ‘Mrs Midas’: ‘Change is explored in Mrs Midas as her relationship with Mr Midas ends as they can no longer be together.’ This was also given **1 mark**.

Extract

The candidate was given **1 mark** for the appropriate reference ‘restful shapes moving’.

The comment ‘this is a contradiction of motion as moving is not restful’ was awarded **1 mark**.

The candidate’s further comment ‘a journey to a new place’ would have been equally acceptable. At this point, the candidate offers a further reference from the extract: ‘I am homesick, free.’ This too would have been acceptable, as would the comments ‘misses her family but she also feels independent and liberated.’

Elsewhere

The candidate now turns to ‘Mrs Midas’. The reference ‘separate beds’ was awarded **1 mark**, and a further **1 mark** was given for the comment ‘they can no longer be intimate.’

The next reference offered: ‘Spitting out the teeth of the rich’ was awarded **1 mark**, and the comment ‘shows he can no longer eat’ was given **1 mark**.

The candidate goes on to provide two further references and comments. Full marks would have been given to this material too, but maximum marks have already been achieved.

Section 2 – Critical essay

The candidate was awarded **19 marks**.

Summary

The candidate has chosen to respond to question 1 from the drama section, using *A View from the Bridge*, by Arthur Miller. The candidate writes about the difficulties faced by Eddie Carbone in dealing with the feelings he has for his niece, Catherine. The candidate successfully relates these feelings to the wider concerns of the text, and to the consequences subsequently faced by Eddie.

Understanding/relevance

The candidate demonstrates a high degree of familiarity with the text, dealing with Eddie's improper feelings towards Catherine, the law of the community, the phone box scene, the consequences of Eddie contacting the immigration authorities, and Eddie's tragic death.

The candidate provides a very good understanding of the central concerns of the text, with comments on loyalty, community morals, and love, loneliness, isolation.

The line of thought offered by the candidate is consistently relevant to the task. All material is directed to the key demand of the question – the difficulties faced by a character.

Analysis/evaluation

The candidate shows a thorough awareness of the writer's techniques, and makes confident use of critical terminology. There is full treatment of the characterisation of Eddie, and clear engagement in comments such as, 'Eddie is harsh on Vinny who was only 14 when he snitched on his uncle. This makes us judge Eddie more harshly later on'. Similarly:

'Eddie demonstrates his feelings with "Madonna type" this suggests he is referring to Catherine as Madonna. This is strange as Madonna was seen as a person of purity and so it portrays that Eddie has high expectations of her that she won't live up to'.

The candidate deals effectively with stage directions, for example:

'Eddie becomes more persuaded to call which is demonstrated by the stage directions "the phone box began to glow on the opposite side of the stage, a faint lonely blue" ...The phone box glows brighter demonstrating how he becomes more tempted to call'.

A range of well-chosen references is used to demonstrate the consequences of Eddie's feelings for Catherine, for example:

"wiping the neighbourhood with my name like a dirty rag...I want my name Marco!" "Rags" are unwanted and so illustrates how Eddie is no longer respected.'

The candidate also deals with the techniques of foreshadowing and irony.

There is clear engagement throughout, and this is evident in the following example: 'This play is poignant as Eddie was in emotional pain.'

Structure/accuracy

The candidate communicates a line of thought which adheres strongly to the key demands of the question, and uses spelling, grammar and punctuation with consistent accuracy.

Overall

This is a very detailed essay which demonstrates that the candidate has a very good understanding of the play. There are occasional weaknesses – paragraphing could have been stronger, for example – but it is comfortably described by most of the statements in the 20-18 mark range, never seeming to go below this standard, or to exceed it. As such, it was placed in the middle of the range and awarded **19 marks**.

Overall, this candidate was awarded 39/40 marks for the National 5 Critical Reading question paper.

Candidate 3

Section 1 – Scottish text: *Tally's Blood* by Ann Marie di Mambro

The candidate was awarded **20 out of 20 marks** for this section.

Question 9

The candidate was awarded **2 out of 2 marks** for this question.

The candidate was given **1 mark** for the point that 'Italians are very hard working,' and **1 mark** for 'they don't break any rules'.

Question 10

The candidate was awarded **2 out of 2 marks** for this question.

The candidate was awarded **1 mark** for 'Massimo wants to move back to Italy' and **1 mark** for 'before the war starts'. These two points cover the essential disagreement between Massimo and Rosinella. The candidate goes on to offer further acceptable material, but full marks have already been achieved.

Question 11

The candidate was awarded **4 out of 4 marks** for this question.

The reference 'I've got nowhere' was given **1 mark**.

The comment 'Massimo is feeling terrified...the place he has called home...doesn't feel safe anymore' was awarded **1 mark**.

The candidate was given **1 mark** for the correct identification of a list. The comment 'shows the amount of things why Scotland means a lot to him' was also awarded **1 mark**.

Question 12

The candidate was awarded **4 out of 4 marks** for this question.

The candidate was given **1 mark** for the reference 'Hughie's arms outstretched, making aeroplane noises.' The comment 'pretending to be a pilot in the war' was also given **1 mark** for the idea of the intrusion of war in their lives.

The second reference offered by the candidate 'Lucia cowering, threatened by it' was awarded **1 mark**. The accompanying comment 'shows Lucia is scared...hears about the war and is frightened' was also given **1 mark**.

Question 13

The candidate was awarded **8 out of 8 marks** for this question.

Commonality

The candidate begins with the extract and discusses how war has affected the character of Massimo: ‘doesn’t know what is going to happen to him and his family.’ This was awarded **1 mark**. The candidate then turns to how war affects another character elsewhere in the play ‘when Bridget gets the letter that Franco has been killed.’ This was also given **1 mark**.

Extract

The candidate was given **1 mark** for ‘Italy coming into the war. It’s looking bad Rosie.’ The comment ‘Massimo becomes scared’ was awarded **1 mark**.

Elsewhere

The candidate was awarded **1 mark** for ‘a mob attacks Massimo’s shop,’ and **1 mark** was given to ‘the war has become dangerous...leaving Massimo, Rosinella and Lucia frightened about what will happen to them,’ for the idea of war as an unsettling force.

The candidate was awarded **1 mark** for the reference ‘Franco has been killed.’ **1 mark** was also given to the detailed comment ‘it (war) has also taken away one of their family members, leaving Massimo, Rosinella and Lucia devastated they have lost their brother, brother in law and uncle.’ The candidate also goes on to offer a comment on the effect of Franco’s death on Bridget: she is ‘completely heartbroken’.

Section 2 – Critical essay

The candidate was awarded **15 marks**.

Summary

The candidate has chosen to respond to question 5. The response opens with a brief account of the poem, stating that it ‘is about a woman trapped in a concentration camp during the Holocaust and all the torture she was put through.’ The candidate identifies the poem’s theme as ‘human suffering’ and states that Duffy uses ‘poetic techniques’ to emphasise the ‘horrific events the Jews had to suffer through everyday which makes the poem memorable.’

Understanding/relevance

The candidate demonstrates familiarity with the text as a whole (the abuse and torture of the Jewish people), and a good understanding of the central concerns: ‘(The poem) highlights how after humans were capable of such immense torture and suffering the world will be forever changed because of it’.

The line of thought presented by the candidate is relevant to the task.

Analysis/evaluation

The candidate offers detailed explanation, touching on specific examples of word choice, such as 'break', which the candidate explains is 'harsh and grim and emphasises the torture'.

The candidate also deals with and explains the word 'salvage', offering the comment that the Jewish people 'were just rubbish the Nazis had to dispose of'.

There is also analysis of 'appalling days', with the comment: 'how horrific their days would have been being tortured differently every day.'

On page 3 of the candidate's response they deal with structure. The candidate explains that the use of enjambment 'creates pause' highlighting how the woman would have been 'terrified because she knows he is about to rape her.'

The candidate makes reference to the poet's use of short sentences (page 4 of the candidate's response), stating that this highlights the suffering 'because they didn't know when they were going to die.'

There is a reasonably developed commentary on what has been gained from the text, for example on page 3 where the candidate notes that 'this highlights yet another torture the Jews would have had to go through.' Similar comments are made throughout the critical essay, and in the conclusion of the essay the candidate makes reference to the 'immense suffering the Jews had to endure.'

Structure/accuracy

The candidate structures the essay very well and uses language to convey a line of thought clearly. The piece is mainly accurate in terms of spelling, sentence construction and punctuation.

Overall

This critical essay is described fully by the statements in the 17-14 mark range. As there were no indications of other mark ranges it was placed in the middle of the range, and awarded **15 marks**.

Overall, this candidate was awarded 35/40 marks for the National 5 Critical Reading question paper.

Candidate 4

Section 1 – Scottish text: *My Grandmother’s Houses* by Jackie Kay

The candidate was awarded **17 out of 20 marks** for this section.

Question 50

The candidate was awarded **4 out of 4 marks** for this question.

The candidate was awarded **1 mark** for the reference ‘Dragging me along to the strange place’. The candidate’s analysis focuses on ‘strange place’ with the comment ‘bizarre and weird place’. This was given **1 mark** for the idea of unfamiliarity.

The candidate was awarded **1 mark** for a second reference: ‘Air is trapped.’ The candidate was also given **1 mark** for the idea of discomfort expressed in the following comment: ‘The persona is describing the atmosphere of the church...enclosed and tight.’

Question 51

The candidate was awarded **3 out of 4 marks** for this question.

The candidate was awarded **1 mark** for the reference ‘By the time I am seven we are almost the same height.’ The candidate was also given **1 mark** for explaining the idea of longevity of their relationship: ‘this also shows how much time the persona and grandmother have spent together.’

The candidate was given **1 mark** for the correct reference ‘rushing me down’. However, the associated comments about the ‘grandmother and persona...working together’ are incorrect, and **0 marks** were awarded here.

Question 52 (a)

The candidate was awarded **2 out of 2 marks** for this question.

The candidate was awarded **1 mark** for the reference ‘rooms lead off like an octopus’s arm.’ The candidate was also given **1 mark** for the notion of complexity of layout: ‘represents the idea of how the house must have several rooms’.

Question 52 (b)

The candidate was awarded **2 out of 2 marks** for this question.

The reference ‘the posh one all smiles’ was awarded **1 mark**. The candidate was also given **1 mark** for: ‘has connotations with elegant and royal’.

The candidate has now achieved maximum marks, but further marks would have been awarded for the reference ‘goose pimples,’ and the comment ‘which is a sign of nervousness’ (for the idea of how intimidated/nervous the woman makes the persona feel).

Question 53

The candidate was awarded **6 out of 8 marks** for this question.

Commonality

The candidate was awarded **1 mark** for identifying the grandmother's strong feelings, as described in the extract: 'she is not ready for the change which shows her strong feelings.'

1 mark was also awarded for an identification of strong feelings in *Gap Year*: '(the mother was) paranoid and worried about her son and waiting for him to come back...misses him a lot.'

Extract

Unfortunately, the candidate has not selected a reference from the printed extract; therefore, **0 marks** were given here.

Elsewhere

The candidate was awarded **1 mark** for a relevant reference from *Gap Year*: 'seeing you shy blowing me a kiss reminds me of the second scan I had at twenty weeks.' The accompanying comment was given **1 mark** for the identification of the strong feelings involved: 'even though the son is on the other side of the world...still being able to keep a connection'.

The candidate was awarded **1 mark** for a further reference from *Gap Year*: 'your foot against my heart.' The candidate goes on to comment on strong feelings here with the comment: 'shows how close the persona and son is mentally and physically'. This was also given **1 mark**.

Section 2 – Critical essay

The candidate was awarded **17 marks**.

Summary

The candidate has chosen to respond to question 3, selecting *Lord of the Flies* by William Golding as 'a novel or short story or work of non-fiction which explores a theme that interests you.' Throughout the essay, 'good and evil' is the theme explored.

Understanding/relevance

The candidate demonstrates familiarity with the text as a whole, with coverage of some of the main aspects of the novel. There is detailed coverage of the dynamics of the relationships between Piggy, Jack and Ralph, and how these relationships reflect some of the novel's wider concerns: 'On both of the sides there is a main character which represents them both' (page 2 of the candidate's response to this question).

The candidate's line of thought is relevant to the task, for example:

'At the start of the novel the theme of good and evil or civilisation vs savagery is shown when "the long scar smashed into the jungle" (page 1 of the candidate's response to this question).

Relevance to the themes of good and evil, civilisation and savagery is maintained throughout, and is a strong feature of the response.

The candidate demonstrates a good understanding of the central concerns of the text. At times, this understanding could be described as 'very good', for example:

'The breaking of Piggy's glasses also shows us the breaking of civilisation and good, since Piggy's glasses were used to make the fire which represented hope and civilisation'.

Analysis/evaluation

Characterisation is explored in some detail, with the candidate making good use of appropriate quotation. For example, with Ralph:

"I'll pass the conch on to the next person." This shows how Ralph is using the conch in order to keep a civilised society'.

The candidate sums up the characters of Jack and Ralph in a reasonably developed way:

'Jack being a ruthless character and being part of the evil and savage side, while Ralph being a civilised and responsible character and being part of the civilised and good side'.

The candidate offers detailed analysis of Golding's use of symbolism. The candidate takes the example of the conch and explains that it is a 'mechanism in order to maintain civilisation amongst the boys'. Similar work is done by the candidate on the symbolism of Piggy's glasses.

Structure/accuracy

The candidate structures the essay very well in order to maintain relevance, and uses language to convey a line of thought clearly. The piece is mainly accurate in terms of spelling, sentence construction and punctuation.

Overall

This critical essay is described fully by the statements in the 17-14 mark range. Due to the consistent relevance to the question, and, at times, a very good understanding of the central concerns, it was placed at the top of the range, and awarded **17 marks**.

Overall, this candidate was awarded 34/40 marks for the National 5 Critical Reading question paper.

Candidate 5

Section 1 – Scottish text: *Bold Girls* by Rona Munro

The candidate was awarded **17 out of 20 marks** for this section.

Question 1

The candidate was awarded **3 out of 4 marks** for this question.

The candidate's first point: 'Marie tells Deirdre about Michael' was too vague and was given **0 marks**.

The candidate's second point was given **1 mark** for the idea that Marie admits that Michael was Deirdre's father.

The candidate's third point: 'deirdre attempts to leave' was given **1 mark** for the idea that Deirdre says she is going home but Marie stops her.

The candidate was given **1 mark** for 'they feed the birds,' which contains the idea that Marie encourages Deirdre to feed the birds.

Question 2

The candidate was awarded **4 out of 4 marks** for this question.

The candidate was given **1 mark** for the reference 'you see I'm just a mug, Deirdre.' The comment 'Marie feels as if she should have known the truth and not been so naïve' was given **1 mark** for the idea of Marie's honesty/frankness.

The candidate was awarded **1 mark** for the reference 'he'd have to change'. The candidate was given **1 mark** for the accompanying comment: 'Marie feels like telling Michael the truth instead of ignoring it' as it has just enough of the idea of Marie's uncertainty of how he would react.

Question 3

The candidate was awarded **2 out of 4 marks** for this question.

The candidate was given **1 mark** for the reference to an example of speech: 'you can't go out like that.'

The comment: 'she doesn't let Deirdre leave, out into the cold' was also given **1 mark**.

The candidate's reference to a stage direction: 'Deirdre pulls the blanket around her' was not pertinent to Marie showing Deirdre kindness, so **0 marks** were awarded.

Question 4

The candidate was awarded **8 out of 8 marks** for this question.

Commonality

The candidate begins with statements about 'Deirdre and Marie' and 'Nora and Cassie.' These statements are vague; however, more detail is offered later in the response.

The candidate was given **1 mark** for 'Deirdre is the daughter of Michael's affair.'

1 mark was also given for further detail on Nora and Cassie: 'Cassie has never gotten along with her mum, Nora.'

Extract

The candidate was given **1 mark** for the reference 'you've got his eyes.'

The comment 'Marie knows that Deirdre is the result of Michael's affair but even with that she can still accept that Deirdre is in fact Michael's' was given **1 mark** for the idea of acceptance/tolerance in family relationships.

Elsewhere

The candidate was awarded **1 mark** for the reference 'me and my Mammy fell out on the delivery room floor.'

The comment 'for as long as she can remember they have always been in conflict' was also given **1 mark**.

The candidate was awarded **1 mark** for the reference 'He never laid a finger on her Marie not once.'

1 mark was given for the relevant comment 'Nora believes that Cassie should be glad and thankful that Joe her husband wasn't abusive towards her.'

Section 2 – Critical essay

The candidate was awarded **12 marks**.

Summary

The candidate has chosen to respond to question 4 from the prose section, selecting *The Pedestrian* by Ray Bradbury, and using the character Leonard Mead as the central focus of the response.

Understanding/relevance

The candidate demonstrates some familiarity with the text. Key plot events are given: Mead is out walking; he encounters the police car; he is questioned and has to cope with these events alone. Some understanding of the central concerns of the text is shown in that we are told that Mead has been arrested 'for

the simple act of walking' (page 1 of the candidate's response to this question), that he is 'independent' (page 3), and that he 'doesn't fit in with his society' (page 4).

The essay is relevant to the task throughout. Topic sentences link each paragraph of the response to the key focus of the question.

Analysis/evaluation

Characterisation makes up most of the analysis in this response. There is an awareness of the writer's use of characterisation in comments such as 'Mead tends to go against authority' (page 1 of the candidate's response), and 'does not belong in society' (page 1).

The candidate does refer to other stylistic devices. There is analysis of the writer's use of punctuation:

"I haven't done anything!" the use of exclamation point shows how surprised Mead is for the simple act of walking' (page 1).

The candidate also makes reference to the 'authoritative tone of the police car' (page 2).

There is a sense of engagement throughout the essay, in commentary on what has been gained from the text, for example 'the reader will feel sympathy for Mead as not only has he been arrested he is being taken away' (page 3).

Structure/accuracy

The candidate structures the essay appropriately in order to maintain relevance, and uses language to convey a line of thought. The piece is sufficiently accurate in terms of spelling, sentence construction and punctuation.

Overall

There is some familiarity with the text as a whole. The line of thought is relevant, and this is the main strength of the essay. There is an awareness of the writer's techniques, and there are some appropriate references and quotations. The essay is clearly described by the statements of the 13-10 mark range, and is therefore placed towards the middle of the marks available. Because of the strength of its relevance, the essay was awarded **12 marks**.

Overall, this candidate was awarded 29/40 marks for the National 5 Critical Reading question paper.

Candidate 6

Section 1 – Scottish text: *The Strange Case of Dr Jekyll and Mr Hyde* by Robert Louis Stevenson

The candidate was awarded **18 out of 20 marks** for this section.

Question 23

The candidate was awarded **4 out of 4 marks** for this question.

The candidate was given **1 mark** for the reference ‘haunt’. The comment which followed this reference was awarded **1 mark**: ‘The writer makes it clear ...by showing Mr Utterson is staying next to the door.’

The candidate’s second reference was also given **1 mark**: ‘I shall be Mr Seek.’

The relevant comment ‘determined to find’ was awarded **1 mark**.

Question 24

The candidate was awarded **4 out of 4 marks** for this question.

The candidate’s first reference: ‘The streets are as clean as a ballroom floor’ was given **1 mark**. The comment: ‘empty, kind of like somewhere abandoned’ was also given **1 mark** for a clear suggestion of suspense and/or tension.

The reference ‘footsteps drawing near’ was given **1 mark**, and **1 mark** was also awarded for the comment ‘the thought of an empty street with footsteps getting closer and closer sends shivers down the reader’s back.’

Question 25

The candidate was awarded **4 out of 4 marks** for this question.

The candidate was given **1 mark** for the correct reference: ‘his fear was only momentary’. The accompanying comment was also awarded **1 mark**: ‘gives a good impression of what Hyde is like. It shows he got a little fright’, for the sense of initial uncertainty in Hyde.

The second reference was awarded **1 mark**: ‘...appeared to hesitate’. The candidate’s comment contains a good understanding of Hyde’s wariness: ‘doesn’t want Utterson knowing his face’. This was also given **1 mark**.

Question 26

The candidate was awarded **6 out of 8 marks** for this question.

Commonality

The candidate was given **1 mark** for a perceptive comment on Hyde's name: 'Mr Hyde's name gives off an impression that he's hiding something.' The candidate has achieved the mark available, but goes on to give further explanation on this point: '...when hiding something that automatically gives the impression that you have a secret.'

The candidate was given **1 mark** for the comment 'The theme of the book is duality' which comes later in the response.

Extract

The candidate was awarded **1 mark** for a relevant reference from the extract: 'Now I shall know you again.' However, the candidate's comment does not pertain to the theme of secrets and was awarded **0 marks**.

Elsewhere

The candidate was given **1 mark** for the reference 'Ape like' which comes from elsewhere in the novel. This reference is sufficiently relevant in that the candidate could have made a relevant point about 'secrets.' Again, however, the comment is not successful, and was given **0 marks**.

The candidate was given **1 mark** for the reference: 'The main secret is Jekyll is Hyde but nobody knows.' Note that a reference does not necessarily need to be a quotation. The following candidate's comment was also given **1 mark**: 'Everyone is suspicious of Hyde from the beginning but nobody says anything.'

Section 2 – Critical essay

The candidate was awarded **11 marks**.

Summary

The candidate has chosen to respond to question 6 from the poetry section. The poem selected is *Mid-Term Break* by Seamus Heaney. The response opens with a brief account of the poem, the candidate stating that the 'poem is written from Heaney's point of view when he was younger'. Later in the response, the candidate identifies the poem's themes as 'death and grief' (page 3 of the candidate's response to this question).

Understanding/relevance

The candidate demonstrates some familiarity with the text as a whole: the death of the persona's brother and the poet's perspective on subsequent events. There is some understanding of the central concerns, eg 'he's bringing the thought of remembrance into the poem' (page 3) and the line of thought is relevant to the task. However, it must be stressed that only some understanding is shown, as

many of the candidate's comments are limited in extent, eg 'Young Heaney has been trapped in the medical room all morning. This would have been long and boring for him' (page 1).

Analysis/evaluation

The candidate shows an awareness of the writer's techniques, which is supported by some appropriate references. This could only be described as 'an awareness', as the analysis could not be described as 'sound' or 'detailed'. For example, the candidate selects the expression 'neighbours picked me up' (page 2), and adds the comment: 'make it obvious something has happed (sic)' (page 2).

Similar analysis is applied to the words 'on the porch crying' (page 3). The candidate deals here with the grief of the persona's father, and the analysis here demonstrates some awareness of more obvious techniques (which is characteristic of the 9-5 mark range): 'for the dad to be crying means he obviously didn't take the death very well' (page 3).

There are some slightly stronger points made later in the response. The candidate's analysis of the poem's title, for example: '...a holiday, or something else that's fun...Instead it's the death of a four year old' (page 6).

Some commentary of what has been gained from the text can be seen in comments such as 'Any child would be heartbroken to see their dad cry' (page 3).

Structure/accuracy

In terms of structure, the candidate works through the poem in a logical order, beginning each paragraph with a quotation for analysis. Language is used to convey a line of thought at first reading. The piece is sufficiently accurate in terms of spelling, sentence construction and punctuation.

Overall

There is some familiarity with the text as a whole, and some understanding of the central concerns. There is an awareness of techniques, but analysis is not detailed or sound, and at times shows only some awareness of the more obvious techniques. Looking holistically at the essay, the demonstration of some familiarity with the text and central concerns, plus the relevance of the line of thought offset weaknesses in analysis. As such, the essay was placed towards the lower end of the 13-10 mark range, and was awarded **11 marks**.

Overall, this candidate was awarded 29/40 marks for the National 5 Critical Reading question paper.

Candidate 7

Section 1 – Scottish text: *The Way My Mother Speaks* by Carol Ann Duffy

The candidate was awarded **18 out of 20 marks** for this section.

Question 36

The candidate was awarded **1 out of 2 marks** for this question.

The relevant reference ‘Shallows of my breath’ was given **1 mark**. However, the candidate’s analytical comments do not come close enough to the idea of the way the speaker is feeling; therefore **0 marks** were awarded.

Question 37

The candidate was awarded **3 out of 4 marks** for this question.

The relevant reference ‘too blue swapped for a cool grey’ was given **1 mark**. Again, however, the candidate’s comments: ‘showing the movement between places’ and ‘the emotions that the different places make the speaker feel’ lack detail and **0 marks** were awarded.

The candidate was given **1 mark** for the second reference ‘Nothing is silent. Nothing is not silent.’ The comment ‘There are mixed emotions about everything to do with the journey’ was also awarded **1 mark** for the idea of the speaker’s confusion.

Question 38

The candidate was awarded **4 out of 4 marks** for this question.

The reference ‘I am happy and sad’ was given **1 mark**. The accompanying comment ‘having mixed emotions’ was also given **1 mark**.

The candidate’s second reference ‘dipped a net’ was awarded **1 mark**, and a further **1 mark** was given for the comment ‘first step into puberty’.

Question 39

The candidate was awarded **2 out of 2 marks** for this question.

The candidate was given **1 mark** for the general summary answer ‘feels very mixed emotions at the end of the poem’.

The candidate was also given **1 mark** for ‘she misses home’.

Question 40

The candidate was awarded **8 out of 8 marks** for this question.

Commonality

The candidate was given **1 mark** for ‘The poet explores the idea of change in “*The Way My Mother Speaks*” with how she’s growing up.’

The candidate was also given **1 mark** for comments on *In Mrs Tilscher’s Class*. Initial comments ‘the change of what goes on in the final stages of early education’ are vague, but later material confirms the mark: ‘ready to move on to the next stage’.

The comment on *Mrs Midas*: ‘the change an action can have’ is not sufficiently developed to have been awarded a mark.

Extract

The candidate was awarded **1 mark** for the reference ‘dipped a net’. The candidate was also given **1 mark** for the comment ‘Shows how she has had her first step into the next stage which is puberty.’

Elsewhere

The candidate was given **1 mark** for the reference ‘Mrs Tilscher smiled, then turned away.’ The comment ‘Her teaching had come to an end’ was also given **1 mark**.

The reference ‘Everyone has wishes. Granted, but who has wishes granted?’ (from *Mrs Midas*), was awarded **1 mark**, and a further **1 mark** was given for the comments ‘showing the confusion...their relationship had eventually soured.’

Section 2 – Critical essay

The candidate was awarded **11 marks**.

Summary

The candidate has chosen to respond to question 3 from the prose section. The candidate has selected the novel *Of Mice and Men*, and has responded on the theme of hopes and dreams.

Understanding/relevance

The candidate demonstrates some familiarity with the text as a whole. The key aspects selected are: the dream to own land; the friendship of George and Lennie; the death of Curley’s wife; the killing of Candy’s dog; the death of Lennie. These are not dealt with in detail, but the candidate does, however, show some understanding of the central concerns of the text: ‘The theme “Hopes and Dreams” can give hope to individuals and encourage them to not give up.’

The line of thought is mostly relevant to the task, in that some aspects of the identified themes are dealt with, but not in any depth. The candidate focuses on how George and Lennie attempt to pursue their dream: ‘two unlikely friends who have this dream “To own a couple of acres, some pigs...”’ (page 1 of the candidate’s response to this question), and how their dream ‘encourages them not to be like other guys, blow your stake on a cat house’ (page 1). The candidate develops this a little by stating that dreams ‘can be affected by the time period,’ and how they ‘can sometimes not come true because of others actions’ (pages 2 and 3).

Analysis/evaluation

The candidate shows an awareness of the writer’s techniques, dealing mostly with characterisation: ‘(Lennie) was always described as a “good guy” but he didn’t know his own strength’ (page 3).

Key incidents – the mercy killing of Candy’s dog, and the death of Curley’s wife – are alluded to, but are not dealt with in detail.

Some commentary is provided on what has been gained from the text, for example in this statement from the conclusion: ‘it shows you can have so much hope and determination for a dream but sometimes they aren’t meant to be’ (page 4).

Structure/accuracy

Language is used to convey a line of thought at first reading. The piece is sufficiently accurate in terms of spelling, sentence construction and punctuation.

Overall

There is familiarity with some aspects of the text as a whole, but some understanding of the central concerns. There is an awareness of techniques, but analysis lacks detail throughout. For these reasons, the essay was judged to be in the lower end of the 13-10 mark range. It was awarded **11 marks** for the strength of its relevance.

Overall, this candidate was awarded 29/40 marks for the National 5 Critical Reading question paper.

Candidate 8

Section 1 – Scottish text: *Brooklyn Cop* by Norman MacCaig

The candidate was awarded **20 out of 20 marks**.

Question 45

The candidate was awarded **4 out of 4 marks** for this question.

The candidate was awarded **1 mark** for the first reference ‘Built like a gorilla.’

The comment ‘Big, stocky and intimidating’ was given **1 mark**.

The second reference ‘hieroglyphs’ was awarded **1 mark**, and **1 mark** was given for the comment ‘you cannot read him’.

Question 46

The candidate was awarded **2 out of 2 marks** for this question.

The candidate was given **1 mark** for the relevant reference to ‘repetition’.

The candidate’s comment: ‘indicates... he knows his job is dangerous...wishes he will return home to his wife’ was also given **1 mark**.

Question 47

The candidate was awarded **4 out of 4 marks** for this question.

The candidate was awarded **1 mark** for the reference ‘nightstick’. The accompanying comment was given **1 mark** ‘carry this baton to protect himself’.

The second reference, to the question ‘whose home is a place he might, this time, never get back to?’ was given **1 mark**. The following comment was also awarded **1 mark** ‘...job is so dangerous.’

Question 48

The candidate was awarded **2 out of 2 marks** for this question.

The candidate was given **1 mark** for the reference ‘have to be his victims?’

The candidate’s comments – on the idea of ‘providing a twist’ – were also awarded **1 mark**: ‘Makes the reader consider who the real victims are. The people affected by the violence are victims but there are also victims of the cop.’

Question 49

The candidate was awarded **8 out of 8 marks** for this question.

Commonality

The candidate was awarded **1 mark** for ‘in Brooklyn Cop...violence and the thin line between savagery and civilised society.’

The candidate was also given **1 mark** for ‘Assisi...themes of poverty, suffering and the hypocrisy of the church.’

Extract

The candidate was awarded **1 mark** for the reference from the extract ‘Should the tissue tear.’

The candidate was also given **1 mark** for the comment ‘explores human experience as he describes the effect of established rules tearing apart.’

Elsewhere

The candidate was given **1 mark** for the reference from Assisi ‘sat slumped like a half filled sack’. The candidate was also given **1 mark** for the comment: ‘how nobody offers to help him.’

A second reference from ‘Assisi’ was awarded **1 mark**: ‘a rush of tourists clucking contentedly’.

The following comment was again given **1 mark**: ‘The tourists are listening but not taking in...’

Section 2 – Critical essay

The candidate was awarded **19 marks**.

Summary

The candidate has chosen to respond to question 3 from the prose section. The text selected is *A Hanging* by George Orwell. The candidate considers the theme of capital punishment.

Understanding/relevance

The candidate demonstrates a high familiarity with the text as a whole, making detailed references to it throughout the essay. The candidate has a very good understanding of the central concerns of the text, as can be seen in: ‘As Orwell realises the “unspeakable wrongness” he becomes angry about how it is possible to kill a healthy conscious man,’ and ‘This strengthens his belief that capital punishment can never be justified’ (page 6 of the candidate’s response to this question).

The candidate’s line of thought is consistently relevant to the task.

Analysis/evaluation

The candidate shows thorough awareness of the writer's techniques, which are discussed in a very detailed way. One example is the candidate's treatment of the technique of pathetic fallacy: '...uses pathetic fallacy to foreshadow the unnatural event by describing the sky and weather as "a yellow light, like yellow tinfoil." The candidate then goes on to comment: '(the sky is) murky and unnatural... "sickly" has connotations of unpleasantness' (page 2).

The candidate offers analysis on Orwell's description of the prisoner, referring to him as a 'figure of pity.' The candidate concentrates on word choice: "puny" has connotations of small, weak and vulnerable...the prisoner appears the opposite of a stereotypical prisoner' (page 3).

The candidate cites Orwell's use of 'dry humour' in the reference 'he and we were a party walking together.' The candidate offers the comment: 'Orwell uses dry humour here as a "party" has connotations of joy, celebration, happiness yet this event is far from all that' (page 6). Here, and elsewhere, there are indications of a well-developed commentary on what the candidate has gained from the text.

Structure/accuracy

The candidate uses language to communicate a line of thought very clearly. Spelling, grammar, sentence construction and punctuation are consistently accurate. The paragraphing is both accurate and effective.

Overall

This is a very detailed and consistently relevant essay which is described exactly by the statements from the 20-18 mark range. For this reason, it was judged to be in the middle of the 20-18 mark range, and was awarded **19 marks**.

Overall, this candidate was awarded 39/40 marks for the National 5 Critical Reading question paper.