

Candidate 1 evidence

Modern studies assignment 14/12/18

Scotland's future

Introduction:

In Scotland a lot of people are concerned about Scotland's future and how will affect them. A lot of people have different opinions about the Scottish government and how they should push for Scottish independence, maximum devolution or go back before there was a Scottish government to direct London rule. The political parties in the UK all want different things for Scotland and can be very diverse on matters.

Over the last 20 years Scotland has had its own government and the UK government has given Holyrood powers on matters like education, environment, energy etc. In 2014 Scotland had an independence referendum which had a record breaking turnout at 84.6% of eligible voters and was the first time 16 and 17 year olds could vote.

Background knowledge:

The SNP want Scotland to become independent from the rest of the UK which would end to any influence of Westminster in Scotland and would give Scotland all the powers to run a country where's as now the Scottish government can't make decisions on defence, immigration or currency. The conservative party want Scotland to stay in the UK and keep the UK as a whole which means the UK government has control on matters that don't effect the rest of the UK, this is by many people as unfair or great because Scotland can get the feeling of in power without being in control. The labour party want to introduce federalism which is a form of devolution above maximum devolution which means any money that Scotland makes stays in Scotland and doesn't go the UK government straight away and Scotland has control of everything in Scotland apart from immigration, defence and currency. This is seen by many as a stepping stone or an alternative to independence.

The options:

The 3 options I have chosen to research are Scottish independence, maximum devolution in Scotland and direct London rule which all have different views on how Scotland should be governed in the future.

Scottish independence advantages and disadvantages:

One advantage to Scottish independence is that Scotland would have more powers which would be good because this is above maximum devolution and gives the powers like immigration, currency, and foreign affairs to the Scottish government. This means Scotland wouldn't need to go to Westminster to ask for more powers because they would all be transferred automatically

Another benefit of Scottish independence is that Scotland could get the government it voted for instead of being out voted by England alone. this is good because before Scotland had its own devolved government Scotland was under direct London rule and continually voted for a labour government but was outvoted by England who voted for a conservative government which lead to closers of mines and power plants by Margaret Thatcher's government and further pushed the argument for Scotland to have its own government and parliament.

Another advantage of Scottish independence is the Scottish government wouldn't need to send money to the UK it makes from exporting goods and taxes. This is good because it means the government could increase spending on public services, education and the NHS which would increase the amount of buses, trains and trams running all over the country. This would also allow the councils more funding to refurbish and build more schools in areas that need them the most. This is backed by a Scottish government report stating that spending for education would be increased if Scotland went independent.

One disadvantage of Scottish independence is that it could lead to separatist movements across Europe becoming more violent. This is bad because this could lead to a national crisis for the country and could be seen by many as terrorism against the country. For example in 2017 Catalonia located in eastern Spain had an independence referendum which was deemed illegal by the Spanish government but the vote went ahead anyway which led to the Spanish police interfering and stopping people voting. This is backed by a report from the Catalan government stating the result was a low turnout at 48% because the Spanish police prevented up to 1000000 people voting. After the result was declared to be in favour of independence by 88% the Catalan government declared independence but immediately suspended its effects. This caused the Spanish government to state that "if Catalonia doesn't stop their independence movement then they would dissolve their government and take direct control.

Another disadvantage of Scottish independence is that the Scottish government is unsure if we would re-join the EU as a full member. This is bad because this means that if Scotland doesn't re-join the EU the citizens would be poorer and less well off if in the EU and independent from the UK. This is backed by a Scottish government report stating that Scotland as a whole if we stayed in the UK but out of the EU we would be £13 billion a year worse off as a country and the people would be £1600 each worse off. The reason that Scotland isn't in the EU at the moment is because the UK government delivered a hard no deal Brexit because Theresa May's Brexit deal won't get through parliament by a large majority objecting it.

Another disadvantage to Scottish independence is that Scotland is heavily relying on North Sea oil which won't last forever and is declining. This is backed by a UK government report stating that North Sea oil would run out by 2040 which would lose Scotland 20% of its GDP and damage the economy severely.

Maximum devolution in Scotland advantages and disadvantages:

One advantage to maximum devolution is that Scotland would get more powers and have the maximum amount of powers it can have without becoming independent. This is seen by many as a stepping stone to independence and by others who don't want independence give Scotland the feeling of being in control. This is backed by a UK government report which states in the 2015 Scotland Act Scotland would receive powers on gambling, abortions and road signs.

Another advantage to devo max is that Scotland could keep the security of the UK like the army. This would be good because the UK government state that Scotland couldn't have a military the size of the UKs because there isn't enough money in Scotland to sustain a military that size and if the nuclear weapons were moved somewhere else it wouldn't take years.

One disadvantage of maximum devolution is that Scotland still needs to go under UK rules for currency and defence which means not every decision would be made by the Scottish government. This is viewed by some as unfair the UK government may as well give us every power we need or that devo max is too far and should go back to standard devolution only control on NHS, education and public services.

Direct London rule in Scotland advantages and disadvantages

One advantage to direct London rule is that Scotland has the same rules and laws as the UK and any law made for the whole UK also affects Scotland. This backed by a UK government report stating that if Scotland didn't get devolution it would be easier to because they wouldn't have a different legal system, education system or NHS.

One disadvantage of direct London rule is that the Scottish people wouldn't get the government they voted for because England would out vote Scotland every time because Scotland has a population of 6 million compared to England at 50 million and Scotland only has 59 seats in the UK house of commons which makes people feel unrepresented in government and people think why should I voted we just get out voted.

Conclusion:

I think that Scottish independence would be the best option because it allows the Scottish government the most powers and wouldn't be affected by Brexit as much as the rest of the UK if they manage to re-join the EU and I think direct London rule would be the worst option because it's not very democratic or fair because Scotland voted for left wing parties like SNP and labour compared to the UK who votes for right wing and central parties like Conservatives and Liberal democrats. Scotland also gets outvoted by the England at general elections.

Higher Modern Studies Research Sheet

Poll of 20 students at _____ in 2018

Should Scotland be an independent country?

Yes	No	Wouldn't Vote
10	7	3

Should Scotland have maximum devolution?

Yes	No	Wouldn't Vote
16	4	0

Should Scotland go back to direct London rule?

Yes	No	Wouldn't Vote
3	14	3

Poll of 20 students at _____ in 2019

Should Scotland be an independent country?

Yes	No	Wouldn't Vote
13	4	3

Should Scotland have maximum devolution?

Yes	No	Wouldn't Vote
15	4	1

Should Scotland go back to direct London rule?

Yes	No	Wouldn't Vote
2	16	2

<http://whatscotlandthinks.org/questions/how-would-you-vote-in-the-in-a-scottish-independence-referendum-if-held-now-ask#table>

Jan 2018	Jan 2018	Mar 2018	Mar 2018	Jun 2018	Jun 2018	Jul 2018	Oct 2018	Oct 2018	Oct 2018	Oct 2018	Nov 2018	Dec 2018
43%	46%	46%	44%	45%	44%	47%	47%	44%	46%	45%	45%	47%
57%	54%	52%	56%	55%	50%	53%	53%	56%	54%	55%	55%	53%

Higher Modern Studies research sheet.



The screenshot shows the Edinburgh News website. The URL is https://www.edinburghnews.scotsman.com/news/politics/scottish-independence-10-reasons-for-yes-an... The page features a navigation bar with categories like NEWS, POLITICS, BREXIT, CITY COUNCIL, and SCOTTISH PARLIAMENT. A prominent article headline reads "Scottish independence: 10 reasons for Yes and No". Below the headline, there is a sub-section titled "More Stories" with a small image of a person.



The screenshot shows the The Independent website. The URL is https://www.independent.co.uk/news/uk/politics/scotland-bill-four-things-you-need-to-know-about-the-ne... The page features a navigation bar with "INDEPENDENT" logo, "SUBSCRIBE REGISTER", and "LOGIN". The article headline is "Scotland Bill: Four things you need to know about the new devolution powers". Below the headline, there is a sub-section titled "What can Scots expect?". The author is identified as Chris Green, Scotland Editor, with a Twitter handle @cghgreen. The date and time are Tuesday 10 November 2015 18:35.