

# Commentary on candidate evidence

The candidate evidence has achieved the following marks for each question of this question paper.

## Candidate 1

### Part D: Migration and empire, 1830-1939

#### Question 13: How fully does Source A explain the reasons for the migration of Scots? (10 marks)

The candidate was awarded **7 marks** as follows:

Judgement: 'Source A explains ... quite fully' – this is a valid judgement. No mark is awarded for this skill.

**1 mark** for 'Source A states that "The inhabitants were in a state of absolute starvation ...". This is a good explanation about migrating to the Lowlands in search of a better life to prevent starvation. (MI1)

**1 mark** for 'Source A also states that "The population of the island had been rising ...". This is a good explanation about migrating to the city tenements in the Lowlands as they were forced out due to limited cottages available on the islands. (MI 2)

The candidate makes the following judgement: 'However, the source fails to mention ...'. The omissions statement is not necessary as judgement has already been made, but it is good practice.

**1 recall mark** for 'opportunities for jobs ...'. This is a good point about encouraging Scots to migrate to provide a better life.

**1 recall mark** for, 'invention of new technology ...'. This is a good point about forcing Scots to migrate as men lost their jobs.

**1 recall mark** for 'loss of home and job ... as their jobs linked to their homes ...'. This is a good point about forcing Scots to migrate in search of a new job and home in the Lowlands.

**1 recall mark** for 'more opportunity to socialise. Lowlands had theatres, shops and football stadiums.' This is a good point about Scots from the highlands wanting a better social life.

**1 recall mark** for 'Free education was now provided to 5–13-year-olds ... easier to access in the Lowlands'. This is a good point about better educational opportunities for their children.

**Question 14: Explain the reasons why the experience of immigrants in Scotland was varied. (8 marks)**

The candidate was awarded **4 marks** as follows:

**1 recall mark** for 'Irish immigrants... created their own community ...' as this is a good explanation about Irish having a positive experience in Dundee.

No mark for 'some Irish were catholic ... to change to protestant' as this is vague on experience.

No mark for 'Jewish immigrants ... menial jobs' as this is vague on experience.

**1 recall mark** for '... anti-semitism wasn't widespread ...' as this is a good explanation related to the positive experience for Jewish immigrants.

No mark for '... marriages between Italians ...' as this is vague on experience.

**1 recall mark** for '... ice cream shops and fish and chip shops ...' as this is a good explanation about the positive experience for Italians.

**1 recall mark** for '... Lithuanian immigrants changed their surnames ...' as this is a good explanation about a negative experience for Lithuanians.

No mark for '... separate newspapers and insurance ...' as this is vague on experience.

**Question 15: Evaluate the usefulness of Source B as evidence of the impact of Scottish emigrants on India. (8 marks)**

The candidate was awarded **2 marks** as follows:

**1 mark** for 'Source B mentions "The minister reported ..." This is a good explanation about the impact of Scots on religious practices in India. (M1)

No mark awarded for 'Source B also mentions "He next suggested ... education of females"' as the explanation does not specifically refer to the Scots impact on education for women in India.

**1 recall mark** for '... the production of tea in India ...' as this is a good explanation on money and trade.

No mark for '... Alexander Kyd ... botanic gardens ...' as this is outwith the time period and vague.

No mark for '... Scots had a bad reputation ...' as this is vague about Scots having a negative impact.

No mark awarded in relation to the author of the source: '... summary of a speech by Reverend Charles ...' as there is no link to impact.

No mark awarded in relation to purpose of the source: '... they had experience on what was going on' as there is no link to impact.

No mark awarded in relation to the timing of the source: '... in the heat of the situation.' This is vague on impact.

**Question 16: How much do Sources C and D reveal about the differing interpretations of the contribution of immigrants to the Scottish economy? (10 marks)**

The candidate was awarded **6 marks** as follows:

**1 mark** for overall viewpoint, 'Source C reveals "... built many businesses which ultimately boosted the Scottish economy"' as there is an overall interpretation on Italian contribution to the economy.

**1 mark** for 'Source C states, "... many good quality ice-cream and fish and chip shops, all highly profitable ..." This is a good interpretation on the contribution to the economy (interpretation of viewpoint, MI1).

**1 mark** for 'Source C states, "... established themselves as successful barbers and hairdressers ..." This is a good interpretation on the contribution on the economy (interpretation of viewpoint, MI3).

**1 mark** for 'However, Source D reveals "... contributed to the Scottish economy by working/building ..."' This is an overall interpretation on Irish contribution to the economy (overall viewpoint).

**1 mark** for 'Source D states, "... Glasgow Subway constructed and tunnelled largely by Irish immigrants.'" This is a good interpretation on the contribution to the economy (interpretation of viewpoint, MI1).

No mark awarded for '... Dundee Hibernians ...' as this is too vague on the impact on the economy.

No mark for '... Jewish immigrants ...' as this is too vague on the impact on the economy.

**1 recall mark** for '... Lithuanians were willing to work long hours ...' as this explanation shows a positive impact on the Scottish economy.

The candidate was awarded **19/36** marks for this paper.

## Candidate 2

### Part E: The impact of the Great War, 1914–1928

#### Question 17: How fully does Source A explain the role of Scots on the Western Front? (10 marks)

The candidate was awarded **9 marks** as follows:

Judgement: 'Source A explains ... to a limited extent' – this is a valid judgement. No mark is awarded for this skill.

The first source point used is not in the marking instructions and is a distractor – no marks awarded.

**1 mark** awarded for 'Source A mentions, "15th division stormed two German defensive lines ... and took Hill 70"'. This is a good explanation on difficult condition for the Scots. (MI1)

**1 mark** awarded for 'Source A mentions, "Black Watch and Seaforth Highlanders suffered heavy casualties ... towards the village of Loos"'. This is a good explanation on Scots courage. (MI3)

**1 recall mark** for '... McCrae's battalion ...' This is a good point of explanation on contribution of Scottish sportsmen on the Western Front.

**1 recall mark** for '... Haig, commander-in-chief ...' This is a good point of explanation on the role of Scots at the Somme.

**1 recall mark** for '... Scots won 5 Victoria Crosses ...' This a good point of explanation on Scots recognised for their fighting qualities at Loos.

**1 recall mark** for '... Daniel Laidlaw ...' This is a good explanation on motivating Scots at Loos.

**1 recall mark** for '... kilted regiments ...' This is a good explanation on the fearsome reputation of Scots on the Western Front.

**1 recall mark** for '... the 51st Division ...' This is a good explanation on the Scots involvement at Beaumont Hamel.

**1 recall mark** for '... McCrae's Battalion were involved in the attack against La Boisselle ...' This is a good explanation on Scots reaching their objectives at the Battle of the Somme.

#### Question 18: Explain the reasons why the Great War had an impact on Scottish society and culture. (8 marks)

The candidate was awarded **8 marks** as follows:

**1 recall mark** for ‘... women such as Bessie Watson ...’ This is a good explanation on the role of Scottish women on recruitment.

**1 recall mark** for ‘... the introduction of conscription in 1916 in Scotland ...’ This is a good explanation on Keir Hardie speaking in Scotland on pacifism.

**1 recall mark** for ‘... Glasgow Branch of National Conscription Fellowship ...’ This is a good explanation on the campaign against conscription in Scotland.

**1 recall mark** for ‘... Lady Haig set up Scotland’s first poppy factory ...’ This is a good explanation on supporting ex-servicemen in Scotland.

**1 recall mark** for ‘... munition work in Scotland ... women ...’ This is a good explanation on contribution to the war economy.

**1 recall mark** for ‘... National War Memorial ... Edinburgh ...’ This is a good explanation on donations and commemoration of loved ones.

**1 recall mark** for ‘... conscientious objectors ... in Scotland ...’ This is a good explanation on military tribunals.

**1 recall mark** for ‘... DORA ... in Scotland ...’ This is a good explanation on the strict rules placed on alcohol and pub opening hours on the Clyde in Glasgow.

**1 recall mark** for ‘... women were earning 30 shillings per week ...’ This is a good explanation on work in munition factories in Scotland offering women economic freedom.

**1 recall mark** for ‘soldiers over 21 ... women over the age of 30 ... given the vote in Scotland 1918 ...’ This is a good explanation on their contribution to politics.

**Question 19: Evaluate the usefulness of Source B as evidence of the effects of the war on Scottish industry. (8 marks)**

The candidate was awarded **5 marks** as follows:

**1 mark** for ‘Source B states, “All types of construction ... cruisers, destroyers ...” This is a good explanation on the variety of warships produced on the Clyde. (M1)

**1 mark** for ‘Source B states, “he saw with wonder and amazement ... their size” This is a good explanation on increasing demand for new and bigger warships on the Clyde. (M2)

**1 recall mark** for ‘... government to buy all of Scotland’s wool ...’ This is a good explanation linked to the wool industry (followed by a confused point about fishing and farming).

No mark was awarded for ‘... 18,000 men who left their jobs ...’ as this is too vague on impact on industry.

No mark was awarded for ‘... Scottish fishermen ...’ as this is not relevant to the question.

No mark awarded in relation to the purpose of the source: ‘... reporting its findings of the impact of WWI on shipping industry ...’ as this does not link to the importance of Fairfields on the Clyde.

**1 mark** awarded in relation to the type of source: ‘... local newspaper ... a sound understanding of the effects of the war on Glasgow’s industry’ This is a good link to reporting the effects of war on Glasgow and the Clyde.

No mark awarded in relation to the timing of the source: ‘... written in 1917 ... will be accurate’. Although it does mention ‘during the war’, it shows no awareness of what was happening on the Clyde at the time.

**1 recall mark** for ‘... North British Locomotive Company in Scotland ...’ This is a good explanation on the change to wartime production of shells and mines.

No mark for ‘... Clyde workers exemption ... impacts the fishing industry ...’ as this is a confused point between fishing and industry.

**1 mark** for ‘Source B “Clyde yards ... vital to our country” This is a good explanation that uses ‘workshop of the world’ to indicate Glasgow’s role in industry. (MI3)

**Question 20: How much do Sources C and D reveal about differing interpretations of the continuing support for political unionism?  
(10 marks)**

The candidate was awarded **10 marks** as follows:

**1 mark** for ‘Source C states, “From mid-1920s these papers were uniformly Conservative ...” This is a good interpretation as many people in Scotland read newspapers which were pro-union (interpretation of viewpoint, MI1).

**1 mark** for ‘Source C states, “The Church of Scotland was unmistakably unionist ...” This is a good interpretation of support for the union in Scotland after the war (interpretation of viewpoint, MI2).

**1 mark** for ‘Source C’s overall view ‘... majority of Scotland ... in favour of the union after the war ...’ The overall interpretation shows support behind unionism in Scotland (overall viewpoint).

**1 mark** for ‘Source D states, “Similarly, many Scottish businesspeople in sectors important to the war effort were Unionists” This is a good interpretation on continuing support from important people in Scotland (interpretation of viewpoint, MI2).

**1 mark** for 'Source D states, "There was a strong streak of militarism in the post-war Unionist party ..."' This is a good interpretation showing many Scots supported unionist candidates who had fought in the war (interpretation of viewpoint, MI3).

**1 mark** for 'Source D 'the war... strengthened ... British identity' This overall interpretation shows the link between unionism and a sense of Scots being British (overall viewpoint).

No mark for '... Versailles ...' as this is confused on the link to political unionism.

**1 recall mark** for '... the National Party ...' This explanation shows a lack of support for home rule and continuing support for the union.

**1 recall mark** for '... in the 1924 election in Scotland ...' This explanation shows continuing support for unionism.

**1 recall mark** for '... Andrew Bonar Law, a Scot ...' This explanation shows his important role in support for political unionism.

**1 recall mark** for '... Liberals ... Home Rule ...' This explanation links the importance of unionism over Scottish issues.

**1 recall mark** for '... violence in Ireland ...' This explanation links the violence associated with Irish independence to fears within Scotland something similar could happen, strengthening support for the union.

The candidate was awarded **32/36** marks for this paper.