

Commentary on candidate evidence

The candidate evidence has achieved the following marks for each question of this question paper.

Candidate 1

Part D – Britain 1851-1951

Question 14: Some women gained the vote in 1918 due to changing attitudes to women in society. How valid is this view?

The candidate was awarded **21 marks**.

Introduction

The candidate was awarded 3 marks because they establish at least two points of relevant background to the issue and identify key factors and connect these to the line of argument in response to the issue.

Paragraph 1: Changing attitudes to women in society

The paragraph begins with a signpost sentence: 'The view of women in Britain had been changing between the 19th and 20th century.'

The candidate goes on to make the following knowledge, analysis and evaluation points:

- ◆ Knowledge point: 'The 1894 local government act enfranchised some women to stand and vote in local elections.'
- ◆ Analysis point: 'If women could 'handle' the vote on a local level, then why should they not be extended the national vote.'
- ◆ Knowledge point: 'Women had also been growing increasingly politically involved. They made up 99% of the Conservative Primrose League.'
- ◆ Analysis point: 'This eroded the societal stereotype that women were uninterested in politics, and didn't want the vote.'
- ◆ Analysis + point: 'However, there were still many societal challenges women faced, they were still not awarded University degrees and expected to leave their jobs once married, this suggests attitudes towards women still had not changed remarkably, not enough to give them the vote alone.'
- ◆ Evaluation+ point: 'Overall, while changing attitudes to women were important, war work was more important still as it involved a far greater number of women. Women only comprised 13.7% of the municipal electorate in the 1890s, whilst war was involved millions of the country's women all helping in a period of national importance. This suggests women's contribution to the war effort was far more important.'

Throughout this paragraph the relative importance of factors is made supported with new evidence, building the line of argument identified in the introduction.

Paragraph 2: Women in the war effort, 1914-18

The candidate makes the following knowledge and analysis points within this paragraph:

- ◆ Knowledge point: 'As men were conscripted to fight abroad, women stepped in to fill their roles. 23,000 women made up the women's land army. They farmed the land and provided a vital domestic food supply during the war.'
- ◆ Analysis point: 'This contribution kept Britain fed and warranted a great reward – enfranchisement 'as a thank you.'"
- ◆ Knowledge point: 'Over 900,000 women were involved in the munitions industry by the end of the war. They suffered yellow skin due to chemical exposure and there were deaths from explosions.'
- ◆ Analysis point: 'Such dangerous work, in line with the sacrifice of male soldiers, deserved enfranchisement comparable to men and proved women were patriotic.'
- ◆ Analysis + point: 'However, the women who were extended the vote initially were largely over 30. The women who were doing the war work were primarily in their 20s, taking credibility away from the theory that suggests women were enfranchised due to their war work.'

Paragraph 3: Suffragist campaign

The candidate makes the following knowledge, analysis and evaluation points within this paragraph:

- ◆ Knowledge point: 'The National Union of Women's Suffrage Societies (NUWSS), also known as the Suffragists, were formed in 1897 by Millicent Fawcett. They used pragmatic demands, like only enfranchising some women and appealing to conservative ideals like religion and morality to earn favourability with the conservative party.'
- ◆ Knowledge point: 'This rational and measured campaigning earned the Suffragists a majority for their bills in the commons and earned support for 'votes for women' from MPs. The NUWSS gathered 250,000 signatures for a petition supporting women's suffrage.'
- ◆ Analysis point: 'This demonstrated there was widespread appeal for women's voting rights and suggested women could be organised, contrary to the opinion of the time.'
- ◆ Analysis + point: 'However, while the NUWSS could get majorities for their bills in parliament, they were unable to get these bills passed into law, suggesting their peaceful techniques were too easily ignored to be effective in gaining women the vote.'
- ◆ Evaluation+ point: 'Overall, the NUWSS were somewhat useful in gaining women the vote, war work was more important as it only took a handful of years of women's war contribution to extend the franchise. This is contrary to

almost two decades of Suffragist activity that had no major gains in women's voting rights to show for it. This suggests the suffragists were easily ignored and the importance of war work was a far stronger provocation.

Throughout this paragraph the relative importance of factors is made, supported with new evidence, building the line of argument.'

Paragraph 4: Suffragette campaign

The candidate makes the following knowledge, analysis and evaluation points within this paragraph:

- ◆ Knowledge point: 'Emmeline Pankhurst, frustrated with slow progress of prior movements, formed the WSPU, more commonly known as the Suffragettes to attempt to extend the franchise in 1903.'
- ◆ Knowledge point: 'They used militant tactics like window smashing and even bombing the summerhouse of PM, David Lloyd George, to bring attention to the cause.'
- ◆ Analysis point: 'This made them impossible to ignore by the government, with the Commons forced to take action and discuss the issue of votes for women in a way they hadn't had to before.'
- ◆ Knowledge point: 'When imprisoned for their militancy, they would hunger strike. The government embarked on a program of force feeding to combat this, which they were widely condemned for.'
- ◆ Analysis point: 'This widespread public disapproval of their actions earned sympathy for the cause of votes for women – earning them public support.'
- ◆ Analysis + point: 'However, some historians believe they were counterproductive. H.I. Peacock writes, 'in general they did little to further the cause. They annoyed and embarrassed the government who's support they had to win.' This is evidence of suffragette militancy alienating political supporters of the cause and compromising women's chance at getting the vote.'
- ◆ Evaluation point: 'Overall, while the Suffragettes were somewhat useful in securing women the vote, war work is more useful, as when the WSPU suspended campaigning during the war, women got the vote in just a matter of years. The WSPU assisted by running campaigns like the white feather campaign – which shamed men into enlisting. We see that when the WSPU assisted with the war effort instead, women got the vote soon after, suggesting war work was of greater importance.'

Again, the relative importance of factors, in line with argument is developed across the essay.

Conclusion

The conclusion contains three relative judgements and an overall judgement, so is awarded 3 marks.

Overall

Historical context (introduction): 3 marks

Use of knowledge: 6 marks

Analysis: 6 marks

Evaluation: 3 marks

Conclusion: 3 marks

The candidate was awarded **21/22** marks for this question.

Candidate 2

Part D: Britain, 1851-1951

Question 16: To what extent were the Liberal social welfare reforms effective in meeting the needs of the British people?

The candidate was awarded **17 marks**.

Introduction

The candidate was awarded 3 marks because they establish at least two points of relevant background to the issue and identify key factors and connect these to the line of argument in response to the issue.

Paragraph 1: Young

The candidate opens the paragraph with a signpost sentence: 'The young were a group of people the liberal reforms aimed to help as they were too young to work.'

The candidate goes on to make the following knowledge and analysis points within this paragraph:

- ◆ Knowledge point: 'The Education Provisions Act was passed in 1906 and this gave free school meals to children who lived in extremely poor families.'
- ◆ Knowledge point: 'The Administrative Provisions Act was introduced in 1907 and this gave free medical inspections to children throughout their time in school.'
- ◆ Analysis point: 'This was important as the meals helped children concentrate and focus better in classrooms as they were guaranteed at least one meal every school day which improved their health.'
- ◆ Analysis + point: 'However, they didn't receive this benefit during school holidays and so their health would deteriorate back to its previous state, reducing its overall effectiveness.'
- ◆ Analysis + point: 'In evaluation, the Liberal social welfare reforms helped the young to a limited extent as the free medical inspections identified illnesses, but there was no funding for treatments to be carried out resulting in 55% of children to go untreated with their known health problems.' (This is a comment on limitation, therefore credited as A+.)

Paragraph 2: Old

The candidate opens the paragraph with a signpost sentence: 'The old were another group the reforms aimed to help as they couldn't work due to their age.'

The candidate goes on to make the following knowledge and analysis points within this paragraph:

- ◆ Knowledge point: 'The Old Age Pension's Act was introduced in 1908 and this gave the elderly above 70 years old a weekly income that depended on their current financial situation.'
- ◆ Knowledge point: 'Married couples received 37p a week and single or widowed pensioners received 5-25p a week depending on their financial situation. They would collect this at the post office.'
- ◆ Analysis point: 'This was important as it provided the elderly with an income to help them buy basic needs like food, keeping them out of the workhouse and from falling into poverty.'
- ◆ Analysis + point: 'However, the average life expectancy for the worker was between 40-50 so many died before being able to receive this benefit which reduces the overall effectiveness.'
- ◆ Evaluation point: 'In evaluation, the Liberal social reforms helped the Old to a limited extent as the pension given was discovered to be below the poverty line – the minimum amount of income to not be in poverty – after a study by Rowntree discovered that they were slightly under the poverty line, so it didn't help many old people escape from poverty.' (This is an attempt at evaluation but gained credit as A+ for the comment on the poverty line as identified by Rowntree. It could have been awarded evaluation if the point had been developed a little further.)

Paragraph 3: Sick

The candidate opens the paragraph with a signpost sentence: 'The sick were another group the Liberal reforms aimed to help as they couldn't work due to illness.'

The candidate goes on to make the following knowledge and analysis points within this paragraph:

- ◆ Knowledge point: 'The National Insurance Act (Part 1) was introduced in 1911 and provided those absent from work with an income.'
- ◆ Knowledge point: 'This benefit would last 26 weeks, with 10 shillings being given for the first 13 weeks, and 5 shillings given every week for the last 13 weeks.'
- ◆ Analysis point: 'This was important as those who were ill didn't fall into poverty straight away after being absent from work and the funds provided helped them afford the required basics like food.'
- ◆ Analysis + point: 'However, the benefit was only short-term as it lasted 26 weeks and so those with long-term illnesses weren't provided for after the 26 weeks passed which reduced its overall effectiveness.'
- ◆ Evaluation point: 'In evaluation, the Liberal social welfare reforms helped the sick to a limited extent as it only provided benefits for the worker, so any other family members who were sick were not covered for which greatly reduces its effects on the British people.' (This is a comment on limitation, therefore credited as A+.)

Paragraph 4: Unemployed

The candidate opens the paragraph with a signpost sentence: 'The unemployed were another group the Liberal reforms aimed to help as they didn't have a job, so could not work.'

The candidate goes on to make the following knowledge and analysis points within this paragraph:

- ◆ Knowledge point: 'The National Insurance Act (Part 2) was introduced in 1911 and this provided the unemployed with benefits when they lost their job.'
- ◆ Knowledge point: 'Both the employer and employee paid 2.5p per week for this benefit and the state contributed 3p per week to cover the unemployed worker.'
- ◆ Knowledge point: 'Labour exchanges also opened and this was a place where workers and employers could register their needs and requirements.'
- ◆ Analysis point: 'This was important as the labour exchanges made it easier for people to find jobs quicker as vacancies could be promoted there, meaning they would spend less time out a job and so would receive a good income.'
- ◆ Analysis + point: 'However, not all employers registered their vacancies or needs and so sometimes it was challenging for many workers to find a job – the act didn't enforce employers to register their needs – which reduces the overall effectiveness.'
- ◆ Evaluation point: 'In evaluation, the Liberal social reforms helped the Unemployed to a limited extent as it only covered workers in certain industries at threat of 'seasonal unemployment' such as shipbuilding and mechanics so most workers didn't receive any benefit.' (This is a comment on limitation, therefore credited as A+.)

Conclusion

The conclusion provides an overall judgement and attempts to balance the effectiveness of the reforms – but also introduces new information in the last sentence on housing. (2 marks awarded)

Overall

Historical context (introduction): 3 marks

Use of knowledge: 6 marks

Analysis: 6 marks

Evaluation: 0 marks

Conclusion: 2 marks

The candidate was awarded **17/22** marks for this question.