

Commentary on candidate evidence

The candidate evidence has achieved the following marks for each question of this question paper.

Candidate 1

Part A – The Wars of Independence, 1249-1328

Question 1: How much do Sources A and B reveal about differing interpretations of the role of Edward I in the Great Cause? (10 marks)

The candidate was awarded marks as follows:

Overall viewpoint: 1 mark awarded for the overall viewpoint of Source A: *'Source A says that Edward I purposely halted the decision of the Great Cause in order to further assure England's control over Scotland at the time'* is a good interpretation of the overall viewpoint as the delay was used by the King of England to increase his control over Scotland.

Interpretation of Source A (MI 2): 1 mark awarded for the Source A quote *'Source A says: "Edward I had long since ordered his lawyers to search for documentary proof of the English monarchy's claim to Scotland." This shows that Edward I showed his authority by trying to find evidence that he was the rightful overlord of Scotland'*. This shows interpretation and makes a good point about Edward's intervention before the Great Cause and is linked to the question.

Interpretation of Source A (MI 1): 1 mark awarded for the Source A quote *'Source A also says: "...What this did was to leave Edward firmly in charge of the Scottish Realm." This shows that Edward was acting in his own interest during the Great Cause, trying to secure his place as overlord of Scotland by not giving the Scots an immediate answer'*. It shows interpretation and makes a good point about Edward using the delay to increase his control over Scotland and is linked to the question.

Overall viewpoint: 1 mark awarded for the overall viewpoint of Source B: *'Source B on the other hand suggests that Edward worked for the best intentions of the Scots during the Great Cause'*. This is a good interpretation of the overall viewpoint as Edward had acted with the best intentions in selecting the right claimant.

Interpretation of Source B (MI 2): 1 mark awarded for the Source B quote *'Source B says: "There was then a further delay by Edward to allow the auditors to consider Scottish law in order to reply to the question by what laws and customs the right of succession should be determined." This suggests that the delay in the Great cause was to help Edward find the most suitable candidate as King, as he carefully spent time reading over Scottish law, therefore benefitting Scotland'*. This shows interpretation and makes a good point about Edward I

2019 Higher History QP2 candidate commentaries

being respectful of the laws in Scotland when choosing the right claimant and is linked to the question.

Interpretation of Source B (MI 3): 1 mark awarded for the Source B quote '*Source B also says: "...He [Edward] does not seem to have had a preference for Balliol or Bruce."* This once again reveals that he was acting in Scotland's best interests, whilst he had laid the rules saying that England was superior, he did not make an instant decision between Bruce or Balliol, suggesting that he was deliberating who was the most appropriate candidate'. It shows interpretation and makes a good point about Edward carefully considering the claims of both Bruce and Balliol before a decision was made and is linked to the question.

Omission: No mark awarded for '*The sources fail to mention that Edward called the guardians of Scotland to discuss the issue of choosing a new Scottish king at Norham in 1291. This showed his dominance over the Scots as he forced them to travel south of the border*' as the question is on the issue 'the Great Cause and Edward's decision' and not 'the Scottish appeal to Edward I – the decision at Norham', therefore the point cannot be credited.

Omission: 1 mark awarded for '*The sources also fails to mention that Edward demanded that the Guardians of Scotland would accept him as overlord of Scotland. This once again showed his dominance*' as it accurately tells us the importance of Edward's claim to overlordship in Scotland and is linked to the question.

Omission: 1 mark awarded for '*The sources also didn't include that Edward I issued the Award of Norham, in which 9 of the claimants to the Scottish throne would accept him as overlord. They did so as they feared that they would be ruled out if they didn't*'. It accurately tells us that the majority of claimants accepted Edward's overlordship so they could be considered in the Great Cause and is linked to the question.

Omission: No mark awarded for '*The sources also fail to mention that whilst the Guardians and Edward were discussing at Norham, Edward brought a large army to the Scottish border. This was to try and scare the Guardians into accepting him as overlord*' as the question is on the 'Description of content issue 'the Great Cause and Edward's decision' and not 'the Scottish appeal to Edward I – the decision at Norham' therefore the point cannot be credited. The question of overlordship has already been credited.

Omission: No mark awarded for '*The sources also fail to mention that Edward I sent a number of Englishmen to Balliol's coronation on the 30th November 1292. This showed his dominance over Scotland*'. The question is on the issue 'the Great Cause and Edward's decision' and the events described are after the final judgement on 17th November, so the point cannot be credited.

Omission: No mark awarded for '*The sources also fail to mention that Edward I forced Balliol to swear fealty to him on the 26th December 1292*'. The question is on the issue 'the Great Cause and Edward's decision' and the events described are after the final judgement on 17th November, so the point cannot be credited.

2019 Higher History QP2 candidate commentaries

Omission: No mark awarded for *'The sources also fail to mention that Edward halted the court at Norham for 3 weeks to allow the Guardians to consider his demand for overlordship'*. The question is on the issue 'the Great Cause and Edward's decision' and not 'the Scottish appeal to Edward I – the decision at Norham' therefore the point cannot be credited. The question of overlordship has already been credited.

Omission: No mark awarded for *'The sources also fail to mention that Edward I pressured all of the claimants to accept him as overlord by the end of 1292'*. The question is on the issue 'the Great Cause and Edward's decision' and the events described are after the final judgement on 17th November which means the point cannot be credited. The question of overlordship has already been credited.

Overall viewpoint	2 marks
Interpretation of the significant views	4 marks
Omission (Recall)	2 marks
Total:	8/10 marks

Question 2: How fully does Source C explain the relationship between John Balliol and Edward I 1292-96? (10 marks)

The candidate was awarded marks as follows:

Judgement: The first two lines in the candidate response *'Source C quite fully explains the relationship between John Balliol and Edward I, however, it misses some key details'* demonstrates 'judgement' which is required to access the full range of marks, though no marks are specifically awarded for this statement.

Interpretation of Source C (MI 2): 1 mark awarded for *'Source C says "Shortly after John was enthroned at Scone on St Andrew's Day 1292 Edward passed judgement on a case involving an appeal from a Scottish court." This shows that Edward was blatantly undermining Balliol's authority as he was getting involved in the political affairs of Scotland'*. It makes a good point about Edward's interference as he had no respect for King John and is linked to the question.

Interpretation of Source C (MI 3): 1 mark awarded for *'Source C also says "On 2 January 1293, however, King John was forced to accept that Edward was released from any restrictions imposed by the Treaty of Birgham." This shows that Edward was pressuring John into making political decisions, harming their relationship and it shows that Balliol was compromising Scottish independence by forgetting about the Treaty of Birgham, causing further tensions in their relationship'*. It makes a good point about Edward forcing King John to make the terms of Birgham null and void leaving Edward free to interfere in Scotland as he wished and is linked to the question.

Interpretation of Source C (MI 1): 1 mark awarded for *'Source C also says "while his own subjects regarded him as King, Edward I regarded him as a subject." This shows that Edward I believed that he had authority over Balliol and had the power to control him. This resulted in an imbalance of power in their relationship'*. The candidate makes a good point about Edward treating John

2019 Higher History QP2 candidate commentaries

Balliol like a feudal lord rather than an equal as kings and is linked to the question.

Interpretation of Source C (MI 4): 1 mark awarded for *'Source C also says "Edward and King John had very different views of what was implied by Edward's position as overlord of Scotland." This shows that there were disagreements over power in the relationship of Balliol and Edward. They had different opinions on the scale of Edwards power over Scotland'*. It makes a good point about Balliol and Edward having very different views on the meaning of overlordship and is linked to the question.

Judgement: The first few lines of the next paragraph, *'However Source C fails to mention some crucial information about the relationship between John Balliol and Edward I'* is the omissions statement, although it is not necessary as a judgement was correctly made at the start of the answer.

Omission: 1 mark awarded for *'Source C fails to mention that a large number of English officials were present at Balliol's coronation on the 30th November 1292. This showed the control that England had over Scotland and shows that there were imbalances of power in the relationship between John Balliol and Edward'*, It accurately tells us John Balliol's status as a sovereign king was undermined by the attendance of English officials at his inauguration which emphasised the new subjection of King John to Edward I and is linked to the question.

Omission: 1 mark awarded for *'Source C also doesn't say that Edward appointed an Englishman, Master Thomas of Hunsingore as Chancellor in Scotland. This once again showed English control and showed that Edward was interfering in Balliol's reign'*. It accurately tells us Edward's interference in the administration of Scotland undermined John's status as King of Scotland and is linked to the question.

Omission: 1 mark awarded for *'Source C also fails to mention that Edward got involved in a legal case called the MacDuff case. He overturned a verdict that had been agreed to by King John, therefore undermining his authority'*. The candidate accurately tells us King John was insulted and humiliated by Edward who exercised his overlordship during an appeals case for the noble Macduff and is linked to the question.

Omission: 1 mark awarded for *'Source C also doesn't say that in 1294, Edward summoned Balliol and other Scottish nobles to fight for him in a war against France. This undermined Balliol's authority as a leader and caused difficulties in their relationship'*. It accurately tells us Edward I demonstrated his superior overlordship over Scotland to demand feudal service from the Scots in Edward's war with France and is linked to the question.

Omission: 1 mark awarded for *'Source C also doesn't say that a treaty was made between France and Scotland in 1295. This was ratified at Dunfermline by Balliol and other Comyn Nobles and caused difficulties in Edward and Balliol's relationship as the English and French were enemies'*. This accurately shows us

2019 Higher History QP2 candidate commentaries

that King John and the twelve guardians attempted to defy Edward by making an alliance with France and is linked to the question.

Omission: 1 mark awarded for *'Source C also fails to mention that Edward forced Balliol to surrender his crown at an embarrassing public ceremony at Kincardine Castle in 1296. This showed that Edward was more powerful than Balliol'*. It accurately shows John's status as a vassal of Edward when he surrendered on 2nd July 1296 and is linked to the question.

Omission: 1 mark awarded for *'Source C also fails to mention that Edward imprisoned Balliol and then sent him to the Pope, following his surrender in 1296. This destroyed Balliol's reign once and for all'*. Despite the inaccuracy regarding Balliol being sent to the Pope, it shows that King John had been defeated and sent to the Tower of London by Edward I and is linked to the question.

Interpretation	4 marks
Omission (Recall)	7 marks
Total:	10/10 marks

Question 3: Evaluate the usefulness of Source D as evidence of the growth of Scottish resistance, 1296-1297. (8 marks)

The candidate was awarded marks as follows:

Timing: 1 mark awarded for *'Source D was made on the 23rd July 1297. This is useful because this is the time when Wallace was beginning his resistance along with other nobles in the south-west of Scotland. Therefore it will contain relevant information from this time'*. It gives a clear picture of the problems of Scottish resistance in the summer of 1297 and is linked to the question.

Author: 1 mark awarded for *'Source D was made by Hugh de Cressingham. This is less useful because he was one of the leaders of the English army in 1297 at the Battle of Stirling bridge, therefore he may have been biased to support the English'*. The candidate correctly notes that Cressingham was an English official, therefore biased towards the English point of view and he would be worried about the growing resistance in Scotland. The point is linked to the question.

Type of source: 1 mark awarded for *'Source C (the candidate means Source D) was written as a letter. This is useful because it would have been written to send accurate information about the events of the Scottish resistance to other people, therefore the information is likely to be accurate'*. The candidate has identified that it is likely to be a true reflection of Cressingham's feelings about the situation in Scotland and this point is linked to the question.

Purpose: 1 mark awarded for *Source C (D) was written to inform Edward I about the rise of Scottish resistance. This is useful because it would contain correct information to give the King an accurate account of the events that were occurring, allowing him to then decide the best plan of action'* as Cressingham

2019 Higher History QP2 candidate commentaries

wrote to Edward I expressing his concerns about the growth of Scottish resistance. The point made is linked to the question.

Interpretation of Source C (MI 1): 1 mark awarded for ‘Source C (D) is useful because it contains “we raised an army against our enemies in Scotland who resist our rule by refusing to pay our taxes.” This is useful because it is historically accurate (not required) and it shows that the Scots began to resist the English by using non-violent methods such as not paying taxes’ as it shows an example of Scottish resistance, especially Cressingham’s attempts to raise taxes in Scotland and is linked to the question.

Interpretation of Source C (MI 2): 1 mark awarded for ‘Source C (D) is also useful because it says “Henry Percy and Robert Clifford have already had to deal with a noble rebellion in the south west led by Bishop Wishart, James the Stewart and Robert the Bruce.” This is useful because it is historically accurate (not required) and it shows that the leaders of Scotland were rebelling against the English. These men had a lot of influence in Scotland and would therefore be inspiring people to resist’. It shows a number of the early revolts in 1297 were supported by nobles and church leaders in the south west of Scotland and is linked to the question.

Interpretation of Source C (MI 3): 1 mark awarded for ‘Source C (D) is also useful because it includes “It was advised however that an attack should be made on William Wallace, who has gathered a large force (and still does) in the Forest of Selkirk.” This is useful because it is historically accurate (not required) and it shows that Wallace was amassing a large following to help resist the English. This blatantly shows that the Scottish resistance was growing’. It shows Wallace had become an important leader gathering a large force and it is linked to the question.

Omission: 1 mark awarded for ‘Source C (D) is less useful because it fails to mention that Wallace’s resistance began in May 1297. He attacked and killed the Sheriff of Lanark which led to the growth of resistance as the Sheriff of Lanark was hated by many Scots’ as it shows Wallace led a resistance movement in the south west of Scotland after the murder of an English official and it is linked to the question.

Omission: 1 mark awarded for ‘Source C (D) is also less useful because it fails to mention that in 1297, Wallace joined with Sir William Douglas, leading a devastating raid across Dumfriesshire and killing the English justiciar William Ormesby. This showed that the resistance was being joined by more Scottish leaders and nobles’ as it shows Wallace led further attacks on English officials with the support of Scottish nobles and is linked to the question.

Omission: 1 mark awarded for ‘Source C (D) is also less useful because it fails to mention Andrew Murray began to capture castles in the North of Scotland from the English in 1297, including Banff. By the end of 1297, he had driven the English out of Scotland North of the Tay. This showed that the resistance was spreading through Scotland’ as it shows de Moray had led a successful resistance movement in the north east of Scotland and is linked to the question.

2019 Higher History QP2 candidate commentaries

Omission: 1 mark awarded for *Source C is also less useful because it fails to mention that the Scots defeated the English at the Battle of Stirling Bridge in September 1297. This was a stunning victory for the Scots and it meant that more people began to support the resistance* as it shows that the Scottish army defeated the English at the Battle of Stirling Bridge on 11th September 1297 and is linked to the question.

Provenance	4 marks
Source content interpretation	3 marks
Omission (Recall)	4 marks
Total:	8/8 marks

Question 4: Explain the reasons for the rise and triumph of Robert Bruce. (8 marks)

The candidate was awarded marks as follows:

Recall: 1 mark awarded for *'Comyn's murder was a reason for the rise and triumph of Robert the Bruce because in February 1306, Bruce murdered his rival John Comyn at Greyfriars Kirk. Whilst this did result in his excommunication from the Church, it did eliminate one of Bruce's major rivals, therefore aiding in his rise to success'*. It explains that Bruce's involvement in the death of John Comyn removed his closest rival to the throne of Scotland and is linked to the question.

Recall: 1 mark awarded for *'Bruce's coronation was a reason for the rise and triumph of Robert the Bruce because Bruce was crowned King of Scots in March 1306 at Scone Palace. This therefore made him a leader in Scotland, gaining him support to aid in his rise to victory'*. It explains Bruce and his followers assembled at Scone on 25th March 1306, where Bruce was inaugurated as King of Scots and is linked to the question.

Recall: 1 mark awarded for *'Inverlochy Castle was a reason for the rise and triumph of Robert the Bruce because he captured Inverlochy from the Comyns. This gained him the support of many nobles therefore helping in his rise to success'*. It explains Bruce was able to defeat his enemies and take the initiative in the civil war gaining support and is linked to the question.

Recall: 1 mark awarded for *'The 'herschip of Buchan' was a reason for the rise and triumph of Robert the Bruce because in 1307, Bruce began attacking Comyn lands. He destroyed crops and killed animals which weakened his rivals and made his rise to success'*. It explains Bruce removed the threat of the powerful Comyn family and is linked to the question.

Recall: 1 mark awarded for *'Edward I's death was a reason for the rise and triumph of Robert the Bruce because in 1307, King Edward I of England died in Cumberland whilst travelling to Scotland for another attack. This eliminated one of the fiercest opposers to Bruce's success, therefore causing his rise to victory'*. It explains that it removed Bruce's main military adversary and weakened the English in their war with Bruce and is linked to the question.

2019 Higher History QP2 candidate commentaries

Recall: 1 mark awarded for *'Edward II was a reason for the rise and triumph of Robert the Bruce because Edward II, who succeeded to the English throne, didn't have the same military ambition as his father, therefore making him less of a threat to Bruce and his reign'*. It explains it allowed Bruce to concentrate on his Scottish enemies as Edward II had weakened English resolve to prosecute the war in Scotland and is linked to the question.

Recall: 1 mark awarded for *'The Battle of Bannockburn was a reason for the rise and triumph of Robert the Bruce because in 1314, the Scots defeated the English at the Battle of Bannockburn. Despite the odds being against them, the Scots emerged victorious, showing that Bruce was a good military leader, which aided in his victory'*. It explains his military success in battle increased his reputation and support which strengthened his position as King of Scots and is linked to the question.

Recall: 1 mark awarded for *'The Statute of Cambuskenneth was a reason for the rise and triumph of Robert the Bruce because the Statute of Cambuskenneth was released in 1314 and made the Scottish nobles choose between their lands in Scotland and England. This ensured that the Scottish nobles who remained were fully supportive of the Scottish cause, therefore helping Bruce's rise'*. It explains it strengthened Bruce's position as King of Scots by securing the undivided loyalty of the Scottish nobles and is linked to the question.

Recall: 1 mark awarded for *'Bruce's brother was a reason for the rise and triumph of Robert the Bruce because his brother, Edward helped Bruce by trying to open up a second front in Ireland in the 1320s. This allowed Bruce to have more dominance over the English, therefore helping his rise to power'*. Despite the incorrect date, it explains the possibility of a Celtic front diverted English attention and forces from Scotland and weakened the English in Scotland. It is linked to the question.

Recall: No mark awarded for *'The Declaration of Arbroath was a reason for the rise and triumph of Robert the Bruce, because in 1320 a strong case was made to the Pope, supporting Bruce's usurpation of the Scottish throne. This was called the Declaration of Arbroath and showed that the Scottish people were supportive of Bruce's claim, therefore helping his rise to victory'*. The letter to Pope John was recognition of the right of Scots to rule themselves and an appeal to end the wars of independence which was not directly relevant to Bruce's rise and triumph.

Recall: 1 mark awarded for *'The Treaty of Edinburgh was a reason for the rise and triumph of Robert the Bruce because in 1328, the Treaty of Edinburgh declared Robert the Bruce the independent King of Scots. This directly caused Bruce's triumph as it made him the rightful King of Scotland'*. It explains the treaty formally recognised Bruce as king of an independent Scotland and is linked to the question.

Points of explanation (Recall)

8 marks

Total:

8/8 marks

2019 Higher History QP2 candidate commentaries

Overall, this candidate was awarded **34** out of **36** marks for this section of the question paper.

Question 1	8/10 marks
Question 2	10/10 marks
Question 3	8/8 marks
Question 4	8/8 marks
Total:	34/36 marks