

# Candidate 1 evidence

## SCOTTISH HISTORY — 36 marks

### PART A — The Wars of Independence, 1249–1328

Study the sources below and attempt the following four questions.

**Source A** from Michael Penman, *The Scottish Civil War* (2002).

As part of the legal process to decide between the claimants to the Scottish throne, Robert Bruce and John Balliol (who was aided by Comyn) now had to choose forty auditors each to represent their interests in legal proceedings at Berwick in front of the English King Edward I, alongside his own twenty-four jurors. But once seated there was an almost immediate adjournment for ten months. What this did was to leave Edward firmly in charge of the Scottish realm. This cannot have come as a surprise; Edward I had long since ordered his lawyers to search for documentary proof of the English monarchy's claim to Scotland. In the end, Edward I announced John Balliol as 'king of Scots' on 17 November 1292. But the outcome of what is now known as the 'Great Cause' was surely a foregone conclusion.

**Source B** from Sir Maurice Powicke, *The Thirteenth Century 1216–1307* (1985).

On 3 August 1291 the competitors for the Scottish throne appeared before King Edward I at Berwick. Edward I, who had much business to do in England, adjourned the hearing of the petitions until 2 June in the following year. There was then a further delay by Edward to allow the auditors to consider Scottish law in order to reply to the question by what laws and customs the right of succession should be determined. The hearings lasted from 14 October to 17 November 1292. The choice really lay between John Balliol, Robert Bruce and John Hastings. Another question also had to be faced by the counsellors. Could a kingdom be divided? Edward had defined the rules of succession by seniority to the kingdom of England in April 1290; but he does not seem to have had a preference for Balliol or Bruce. Finally on 17 November 1292 King Edward declared the judgement in favour of John Balliol.

**Source C** from Ranald Nicholson, *Scotland The Later Middle Ages* (1974).

John Balliol set out to be no less a king than those before him. John's position however was an impossible one: while his own subjects regarded him as a king, Edward I regarded him as a subject. Shortly after John was enthroned at Scone on St Andrew's Day 1292 Edward passed judgement on a case involving an appeal from a Scottish court. A number of Scottish nobles petitioned Edward that he should keep to the Treaty of Birgham which would forbid the hearing of such appeals outwith Scotland. On 2 January 1293, however, King John was forced to accept that Edward was released from any restrictions imposed by the Treaty of Birgham. Edward and King John had very different views of what was implied by Edward's position as overlord of Scotland.

MARKS

## SCOTTISH HISTORY — PART A (continued)

**Source D** from a letter from Hugh de Cressingham to Edward I, 23 July 1297.

Sire, upon the advice of your council here in Berwick, we raised an army against our enemies in Scotland who resist our rule by refusing to pay our taxes. Henry Percy and Robert Clifford have already had to deal with a noble rebellion in the south west led by Bishop Wishart, James the Stewart and Robert Bruce. Peace had been made on this side of the Firth of Forth; however this has not settled affairs in Scotland. It was advised however that an attack should be made on William Wallace who had gathered a large force (and still does) in the Forest of Selkirk. It has however been decided that no action is to be taken until the arrival of the Earl of Warenne.

Attempt ALL of the following questions.

1. How much do **Sources A** and **B** reveal about differing interpretations of the role of Edward I in the Great Cause? 10  
*Use the sources and recalled knowledge.*
2. How fully does **Source C** explain the relationship between John Balliol and Edward I 1292–96? 10  
*Use the source and recalled knowledge.*
3. Evaluate the usefulness of **Source D** as evidence of the growth of Scottish resistance, 1296–1297. 8  
*In reaching a conclusion you should refer to*
  - *the origin and possible purpose of the source*
  - *the content of the source*
  - *recalled knowledge.*
4. Explain the reasons for the rise and triumph of Robert Bruce. 8

ENTER  
NUMBER  
OF  
QUESTIONDO NOT  
WRITE IN  
THIS  
MARGIN

1 Sources A and B reveal ~~different~~ differing interpretations of the role of Edward I in the Great Cause.

Source A says that Edward I purposely halted ~~a decision~~ the decision of the Great Cause in order to further assure England's control over Scotland at the time. Source A says, "Edward I had long since ordered his lawyers to search for documentary proof of the English monarchy's claim to Scotland." This shows that Edward I showed his authority by trying to find evidence that he was the rightful overlord of Scotland. Source A also says, "But once seated there was an almost immediate adjournment for ten months. What this did was to leave Edward firmly

ENTER  
NUMBER  
OF  
QUESTIONDO NOT  
WRITE IN  
THIS  
MARGIN

in charge of the Scottish Realm". This shows that Edward was acting in his own ~~an~~ interest during the Great Cause, trying to secure his place as overlord ~~by~~ of Scotland by not giving the ~~&~~ Scots an ~~an~~ immediate answer.

Source B on the other hand suggests that Edward worked for the best intentions of the Scots during the Great cause, trying to pick the most appropriate candidate for the throne. Source B says, "There was ~~a~~ then a further delay ~~was~~ by Edward to allow the auditors to consider Scottish law in order to reply to the question by what laws and customs the right of succession should be <sup>determined</sup>. This suggests that the delay in the Great cause was to help Edward find

ENTER  
NUMBER  
OF  
QUESTIONDO NOT  
WRITE IN  
THIS  
MARGIN

the most suitable ~~an~~ candidate as King, therefore as he carefully spent time reading over Scottish law, therefore being fitting Scotland. Source B also says, "Edward had defined the rules of succession by seniority to the kingdom of England in April 1290; but he does not seem to have had a preference for ~~Balliol~~ Balliol or Bruce." This once again reveals that he was acting in Scotland's best interests, whilst he had laid the rules saying that England was superior, he did not make an instant decision between Bruce or Balliol, suggesting that he was deliberating who was the most appropriate candidate.

However, sources B and C fail to mention

ENTER  
NUMBER  
OF  
QUESTIONDO NOT  
WRITE IN  
THIS  
MARGIN

~~Some~~ on some crucial ~~an~~ information about Edward I's role in the great cause. The sources fail to mention that Edward called the guardians of Scotland to discuss the issue of ~~the~~ crossing a new Scottish King <sup>at Northam</sup> <sup>in</sup> 1291. This showed his dominance ~~of~~ over the Scots as he forced them to travel south of the border. The sources also fails to mention that Edward demanded that the ~~Guardians~~ ~~are~~ Guardians of Scotland would accept him as overlord of Scotland. This once again showed his dominance. The sources also didn't include that Edward I issued the Award of Northam, in which 9 of the claimants to the Scottish ~~thron~~ throne would accept him as overlord. They did so as they feared that

ENTER  
NUMBER  
OF  
QUESTIONDO NOT  
WRITE IN  
THIS  
MARGIN

they would be ruled out if they didn't.

The sources also fail to mention that whilst the Guardians and Edward were discussing at Northampton, Edward brought a large army to the St Scottish border. This was to try and ~~do~~ scare the Guardians into accepting him as overlord.

The sources also fail to mention that Edward I sent a number of Englishmen to Balliol's coronation on the 30<sup>th</sup> November 1292. This showed his dominance over Scotland. The sources also fail to mention that Edward I forced Balliol to <sup>swear fealty</sup> accept ~~him~~ <sup>to him</sup> as overlord on the 26<sup>th</sup> December 1292. Throughout the great cause, Edward had pressured Balliol and the other claimants.

The sources also fail to mention that

ENTER  
NUMBER  
OF  
QUESTIONDO NOT  
WRITE IN  
THIS  
MARGIN

Edward halted the court at Northam for 3 weeks to allow ~~the~~ the Guardian's to consider his ~~request~~ demand for overlordship.

The sources also fail to mention that Edward I pressured all of the Claimants to accept him as overlord by the end of 1292.

2. Source C quite fully explains the relationship between John Balliol and Edward I, however, it misses some key details.

Source C says, "Shortly after John was enthroned at Scone on St Andrew's day 1292, Edward passed judgement on a case involving an appeal from the Scottish court." This shows that Edward was blatantly undermining Balliol's authority as he was getting involved



ENTER  
NUMBER  
OF  
QUESTIONDO NOT  
WRITE IN  
THIS  
MARGIN

in the political affairs of Scotland. He was also breaking the Treaty of ~~Burgham~~ Burgham which caused further tension between Balliol and Bruce. Source C also says, "On 2 January 1293, however, King John was forced to accept that Edward was released from any restrictions imposed by the ~~Treaty~~ Treaty of Burgham". This shows that Edward was pressuring John into making political decisions, harming their relationship and it shows that ~~Edward was~~ Balliol was compromising Scottish independence by forgetting about the Treaty of Burgham, causing further tension in their relationship. Source C also says, "while his own subjects regarded him as King, Edward I regarded him as a subject." This shows

ENTER  
NUMBER  
OF  
QUESTIONDO NOT  
WRITE IN  
THIS  
MARGIN

that Edward I believed that he had authority over Balliol and had the power to control him. This resulted in an imbalance of power in ~~the~~ their relationship.

Source C also says, "Edward and King John had very different views of what was implied by Edward's position as overlord of Scotland." This shows that there were disagreements over power in the ~~the~~ relationship of Balliol and Edward. They had different opinions on the scale of Edward's power over Scotland.

However Source C fails to mention some crucial information about the relationship between John Balliol and Edward I. Source C fails to mention that ~~an~~ a large number of English officials were present at Balliol's coronation on

ENTER  
NUMBER  
OF  
QUESTIONDO NOT  
WRITE IN  
THIS  
MARGIN

the 30<sup>th</sup> November 1292. This showed the control that England had over Scotland and shows that there were imbalances of power in the relationship between John Balliol and ~~the~~ Edward. Source C also doesn't say that Edward appointed an Englishman, Master Thomas of Hunsingore as Chancellor in Scotland. This once again showed English control and showed that Edward was interfering in Balliol's reign. Source C also fails to mention that Edward got involved in a legal case called the MacDuff Case. He overturned a verdict that had been agreed to by King John, therefore undermining his authority. Source C also doesn't say that in ~~the~~ 1294, Edward summoned Balliol and other Scottish nobles to fight for him in a war against France. This undermined Balliol's authority as a leader and ~~also~~ caused difficulties in their relationship.

ENTER  
NUMBER  
OF  
QUESTIONDO NOT  
WRITE IN  
THIS  
MARGIN

Source C also doesn't say that ~~it~~ a treaty was ~~made~~ made between France and Scotland in ~~1291~~ 1295. This was ratified ~~by~~ <sup>at</sup> Dumfermline ~~by~~ Balliol and other ~~Scottish~~ Comyn Nobles and caused difficulties in Edward and Balliol's relationship as the English and French were enemies. Source C also fails to mention that Edward forced Balliol to surrender his crown at an embarrassing public ceremony at Kincairdine Castle in 1296. This ~~is~~ showed that Edward was more powerful than Balliol. Source C also fails to mention that Edward imprisoned Balliol and then sent him to the Pope, following his surrender in 1296. This destroyed Balliol's reign once and for all. ~~Source C~~ →

ENTER  
NUMBER  
OF  
QUESTIONDO NOT  
WRITE IN  
THIS  
MARGIN

3. Source D is quite useful as evidence of the growth of Scottish resistance, however it fails to mention some key details.

Source D was made in July 1297 on the 23 July 1297. This is useful because this is the time when Wallace was beginning his resistance along with other nobles in the south-west of Scotland, therefore it will contain relevant information from this time.

Source D was made by Hugh de Cressingham. This is ~~useful because he~~

ENTER  
NUMBER  
OF  
QUESTIONDO NOT  
WRITE IN  
THIS  
MARGIN

less useful because he was one of the leaders of the English army in 1297 at the Battle of Stirling bridge, therefore he may have been biased to support the English. Source C was written as a letter. This is useful because it would have been written to send accurate information about the events of the Scottish ~~to~~ resistance to other people, therefore the information is likely to be accurate. Source C was written to inform Edward I about the rise ~~on~~ of ~~the~~ the Scottish resistance. This is useful because it would contain correct information to give the King an accurate account of ~~the~~ ~~the~~ the events that were occurring, allowing him to then decide the best plan of action.

ENTER  
NUMBER  
OF  
QUESTIONDO NOT  
WRITE IN  
THIS  
MARGIN

Source C is useful because it contains, "we raised an army against our enemies in Scotland who resist our rule by refusing to pay our taxes." This is useful because it is historically accurate and it shows that the Scots began to ~~the~~ resist the English by using non-violent methods such as not paying taxes. Source C is also useful because it says, "Here Henry Percy and Robert ~~the~~ Clifford have already ~~to~~ had to deal with a noble rebellion in the south west led by Bishop Wishart, James the Stewart and Robert the Bruce." This is useful because it is historically accurate and it shows that the ~~Scots~~ leaders of Scotland were rebelling against the English. ~~They~~ These men had a lot of influence in Scotland

ENTER  
NUMBER  
OF  
QUESTIONDO NOT  
WRITE IN  
THIS  
MARGIN

and would therefore be inspiring people to resist. Source ~~Mans~~ C is also useful because it includes that, "It was advised however that an attack should be made on William Wallace who had gathered a large ~~following~~ force (and still does) in the Forest of Selkirk." This is useful because it is historically accurate and it shows that Wallace was amassing a large following to help ~~resist~~ resist the English. This blatantly shows that the Scottish resistance was growing.

However, Source C is less useful ~~because~~ because it ~~also~~ fails to include some historically relevant information. Source C is less useful because it fails to mention that, Wallace's resistance began in May 1297. He ~~was~~ attacked



ENTER  
NUMBER  
OF  
QUESTIONDO NOT  
WRITE IN  
THIS  
MARGIN

and he killed the Sheriff of Lanark which led to the growth of the resistance as the Sheriff of Lanark was hated by many Scots. Source A C is also less useful because it fails to mention that in 1297, Wallace teamed up with joined forces with Sir William Douglas, leading a devastating raid across Dumfriesshire and killing English justices William of Ormesby. This showed that the resistance was being joined by more Scottish leaders and nobles. Source C is also less useful because it fails to mention that following the Battle of Dunbar in 1293, Andrew Murray was captured, escaped English capture and returned to his lands in Scotland, finding they had been taken by the English.

ENTER NUMBER OF QUESTION	DO NOT WRITE IN THIS MARGIN
	<p>Andrew Murray began to capture castles in the North of Scotland<sup>in 1297</sup> from the English<sup>the end of 1297</sup>, including Ban Banff. By <sup>1298</sup>, he had driven the English out of Scotland North of the Tay. This showed that the resistance was spreading through Scotland.</p> <p>Source C is also less useful because it fails to mention that the Scots defeated the English at the Battle of Stirling Bridge in September 1297. This was a stunning victory for the Scots and it meant that more people began to support the resistance.</p>
4.	<p>Comyn's murder was a reason for the rise and triumph of Robert the Bruce <del>becu</del> because <del>in</del> in February <del>12</del> 1306, Bruce murdered his rival John Comyn at Greyfriars' Kirk. Whilst this did result in his <del>an</del> excommunication from</p>

ENTER  
NUMBER  
OF  
QUESTIONDO NOT  
WRITE IN  
THIS  
MARGIN

the Church, it did eliminate one of Bruce's major ~~own~~ rivals, ~~therefore~~ therefore aiding in his rise to success.

Bruce's coronation was a reason for the rise and triumph of Robert the Bruce because Bruce was crowned King of Scots in March 1306 at Scone Palace.

This therefore made him a leader in Scotland, gaining him support to aid in his rise to victory.

~~The~~ Inverlochy Castle was a reason for the rise and triumph of Robert the Bruce because he captured Inverlochy from the Comyns. This gained him the support of many nobles ~~at~~ therefore helping in his rise to success.

The 'hersehip of Buchan' was a reason for the rise and triumph of Robert the

ENTER  
NUMBER  
OF  
QUESTIONDO NOT  
WRITE IN  
THIS  
MARGIN

Bruce because in 1307, Bruce began attacking Comyn lands. He destroyed crops and killed animals which weakened his rivals and made his rise to success.

~~The~~ ~~Best~~ Edward I's death was a reason for the rise and triumph of Robert the Bruce because in 1307, King Edward I of England died in Cumberland whilst travelling to Scotland for another attack. This eliminated one of the fiercest opposers to Bruce's success, therefore causing his rise to victory.

Edward II was a reason for the rise and triumph of Robert the Bruce because Edward II ~~didn't~~ have the same ~~milita~~, who succeeded to the English throne, ~~he~~ didn't have the same military ambition as his

ENTER NUMBER OF QUESTION	DO NOT WRITE IN THIS MARGIN

father, therefore making him less of a threat to Bruce and his reign.

The Battle of Bannockburn was a reason for the rise and triumph of Robert the Bruce because in 1314, the Scots defeated the English at the Battle of Bannockburn. Despite the odds being against them, the Scots emerged victorious, showing that Bruce was a good military leader, which aided in his victory.

The Statute of Cambuskenneth was a reason for the rise and triumph of Robert the Bruce because the Statute of Cambuskenneth was released in 1314 and made the Scottish nobles choose between their lands in Scotland and England. This ensured that the ~~Scott~~ Scottish nobles who

ENTER NUMBER OF QUESTION	DO WRI T. MAI
	<p>remained were fully supportive of the Scottish cause, therefore helping Bruce's rise.</p> <p>Bruce's brother was a reason for the rise and triumph of Robert the Bruce because his brother, Edward helped Bruce by trying to open up a second front in Ireland in the <del>1320</del> 1320s. This allowed Bruce to have more <del>dominance</del> dominance over the English, therefore helping his rise to victory.</p> <p>The Declaration of Arbroath was a reason for the rise and <del>triumph</del> triumph of Robert the Bruce, because in 1320 a strong case was made to the <del>po</del> Pope, supporting Bruce's usurpation of the Scottish throne.</p> <p>This was called the <del>the</del> Declaration of</p>

ENTER NUMBER OF QUESTION	DO NOT WRITE IN THIS MARGIN

Arbroath and showed that the Scottish people were supportive of Bruce's claim, therefore helping his rise to victory.

The Treaty of Edinburgh was a reason for the rise and triumph of Robert the Bruce because in 1328, the Treaty of Edinburgh ~~acted~~ declared Robert the Bruce the independent King of Scots.

This directly caused Bruce's triumph as it made him the rightful King of Scotland.