Commentary on candidate evidence

The candidate evidence has achieved the following marks for each question of this question paper.

Candidate 1

Question 42: To what extent was the role of Ronald Regan the main reason why the Cold War ended?

The candidate was awarded 13 marks for this question as follows:

Introduction

Background to the issue is given in the first five sentences. Two pieces of background given in total.

Factors are given by the candidate: 'The Role of Ronald Regan was important as a reason for why the Cold War ended, however, there were other contributing factors such as the Role of Gorbachev, the Western economic strengths and the fall of Communism in Eastern Europe.'

No line of argument awarded as the question has not been addressed: 'The role of Gorbachev was the main reason as to why the Cold War ended.'

The candidate was awarded **2** (historical context) marks for establishing at least one point of relevant background to the issue and identifying key factors or connecting these to the line of argument.

Paragraph 1: Role of Regan

Knowledge point awarded for: 'When Ronald Regan was President of the United States he brought in what was called the Regan doctrine.'

Knowledge point awarded for: 'Part of the Regan doctrine was that the USA would fund right-wing movements that opposed Communism.'

Nothing was awarded for the attempt at analysis as it fails to meet the aims of the question: 'This was important as the Soviet Union did not have a strong enough economy to retaliate.'

Knowledge point awarded for: 'Ronald Regan also increased the production of oil which therefore decreased demand and lowered the price.'

Analysis point awarded for: 'This therefore had a significant effect on the Soviet Unions economy as they had lost demand for one of their staple exports.'

Nothing was awarded for the following as it repeats previous points made: 'The Role of Ronald Regan was significant as a reason for the ending of the Cold War as he was attempting to "price" the Soviet Union out of the war and did so rather successfully. Gorbachev was more important as a reason for the end of the Cold War as he was the first leader to move away from the Cold War mind-sets.'

Paragraph 2: Role of Gorbachev

Knowledge point awarded for: 'When Gorbachev came into power he introduced polices of perestroika and glasnost which meant restructuring and openness.'

Analysis point awarded for: 'This was important as Communist systems were being relaxed and criticism of the USSR was allowed. This made them less of a threat to the USA.'

Knowledge point awarded for: 'Gorbachev also recognised that the USSR could not be isolated and so he introduced his policy of "New Thinking" which encouraged trade with western countries.'

Analysis point awarded for: 'This as a result eased tensions between the USA and the Soviet Union. The role of Gorbachev was very significant as a reason for the end of the Cold War because it was the first step of moving away from the conflict of ideologies and opened the USSR up to the West.'

Paragraph 3: Failure of Communism in Eastern Europe

Knowledge point awarded for: 'When Gorbachev was in power he also removed the Brezhnev doctrine which had previously upheld Communism in other countries.'

Knowledge point awarded for: 'This then allowed Eastern European countries to find their own way to run there countries without being controlled and forced under communism by the USSR.'

Knowledge point awarded for: 'In Poland, this started with trade union activism and the Solidarity movement. This opposition would have previously been shut down but it was welcomed in this new atmosphere. This then led to an election in Poland which elected Lech Walesa as the first non-Communist leader in many several years.'

Analysis point awarded for: 'This is seen by Historians as a turning point in the Cold War as other Eastern European countries followed the actions of Poland. The fall of Communism in Eastern Europe was significant as a reason for the end of the Cold War as it reduced the Soviet Union's sphere of influence and made them less of a threat to the west.'

Paragraph 4: Economic differences between East and West

Knowledge point awarded for: 'Throughout the Cold War, the Western powers were flourishing economically under Communism. This then allowed them to pump money into weaker countries to turn them away from Communism. It also meant they could produce more weaponry and beat the Soviet Union in the arms race.'

Knowledge point awarded for: 'The Western powers enjoyed many trade deals which increased their good relations with other countries and boosted their economy. As a result, in order to compete with the USA economically, the USSR would have to improve relations with other countries and increase their co-operation.'

Nothing awarded for the remainder of the paragraph.

Conclusion

'In conclusion, the role of Reagan was the main reason the Cold War ended to some extent. Reagan ensured that the Soviet Union's economy would continue to fail which would eventually price them out of the Cold War. The fall of Communism was a more significant reason for the end of the Cold War because it extremely reduced the Soviet Union's power all over the world which made them no threat to the USA. The Western economic strengths was a less significant reason because it was not instrumental in the Soviet Union's failing economy, it was more their own fault. (The candidate has made a judgement between factors without stressing the importance of the line of argument). The role of Gorbachev was the most significant reason for the end of the Cold War as he had a completely different mindset to previous Soviet leaders and he was not looking to spread communism which therefore massively reduced the tensions between the USA and the Soviet Union and ultimately ended the Cold War.' (Judgement)

2 marks were awarded for the conclusion as the candidate makes an overall judgement between factors.

Historical context: 2/3

Use of knowledge: 6/6

Analysis: 3/6

Evaluation: 0/4

Conclusion: 2/3

Total: 13/22

Candidate 2

Question 32 Russia: How important was Bloody Sunday as a reason for the 1905 Revolution?

The candidate was awarded **15 marks** for this question as follows:

Introduction

Background to the issue is given in the first 8 lines. Two pieces of background are given in total.

Factors are given: 'There were many reasons for the 1905 revolution including worker and peasant discontent, political problems, bloody sunday and the Russo-Japanese war.'

Line of argument is given: 'The event of Bloody Sunday was a crucial reason for the 1905 Revolution as it can be seen as the spark which caused it.'

The introduction was awarded **3 (historical context) marks** as the candidate establishes at least two points of relevant background to the issue and identifies key factors and connects these to the line of argument in response to the issue.

Paragraph 1: Working class discontent and discontent among the peasantry

The candidate starts with a signpost sentence. (No mark is given for this, but it is good practice): 'One reason for the 1905 revolution was peasant and worker discontent.'

Knowledge point awarded for: 'Workers were unsettled due to the horrible working conditions and low wages which had no sign of being resolved by the Tsar.'

Knowledge point awarded for: 'Peasants were troubled due to low availability of workable land which led to a poorer way of life for them.'

Analysis point awarded for: 'This shows that the people of Russia were deeply unsatisfied with the role of the Tsar as he showed little care for his people or the quality of life they had.'

Developed analysis point awarded for: 'However, this would not have alone been able to cause a revolution as there was no strong spark such as Bloody Sunday to cause great

disturbance and no unified cause for both workers and peasants to join together as they, if they did revolt, would most likely be crushed by the military just as done so in the past.'

Nothing awarded for attempt at evaluation as it merely summarises arguments already made.

Paragraph 2: Political problems

The candidate starts with a signpost sentence. (No mark is given for this, but it is good practice): 'Another cause was political problems in Russia.'

Knowledge point awarded for: 'There had also been a call for some form of elected assembly which the Tsar had no intention of fulfilling which caused for many intelligentsia to agree that a change needed to be made.'

Analysis point awarded for 'This shows that even the upper classes were discontented with the Tsar, not just the workers, so greater amounts of tension were built across all aspects of Russian society making revolution likely.'

Developed analysis point awarded for: 'However, the failure of the 'go to the people' showed how politicians were unable to politicise peasants and how it would be difficult to cause an uprising for the same reasons'.

Analysis point awarded for: 'In evaluation, political problems were important for the 1905 revolution as it showed that the Tsar was so incompetent he couldn't keep any aspects of his country satisfied so there was a greater call for change from a wider range of classes.'

Paragraph 3: Military defeat in the war against Japan

The candidate starts with the following introductory sentence: 'Furthermore, the Russo-Japanese was an important cause of the 1905 revolution.' No mark is given for this, but it is good practice.

Knowledge point awarded for: 'During this war both Port Arthur and Mukden fell to the Japanese due to the Tsar greatly underestimating their strength.'

Knowledge point awarded for: 'This resulted in the Treaty of Portsmouth being declared which stated Japan as the winners of the war and declared that Russia must remove all troops from Manchuria.'

Analysis point awarded for: 'This shows that the myth of the Tsar invisibility was proven wrong to the population which helped people to see that it would be possible to overthrow him as well as prove him as not a good leader.'

Analysis point awarded for: 'In evaluation the Russo-Japanese war was an important reason for the 1905 revolution as it helped to create tension between the Tsar and his people as money and time was spent on this war they lost rather than on improving working conditions or improving the politics of Russia.'

Paragraph 4: Bloody Sunday

Knowledge point awarded for: 'This event caused an uproar from the people of Russia and allowed all classes to bond with a unified cause to attempt to overthrow the Tsar immediately after.'

Analysis point awarded for: 'This shows that Bloody Sunday was important as it allowed for a spark to be created after all the build up of tension in the country and gave workers, peasants and intelligentsia a common cause to challenge the Tsars authority.'

The candidate attempts to introduce evaluation but is awarded an **analysis point**: 'In evaluation, Bloody Sunday is an important reason for the 1905 revolution as it showed that the Tsars lack of regard for his people as he readily opened fire upon a defenceless crowd who were in protest to his poor authority.'

Conclusion

'In conclusion, Bloody Sunday was the most important reason for the 1905 revolution because it helped to unify the people of Russia as they saw the incompetence of the Tsar and his willingness to go against his own people rather than work with them.

(Judgement). Although the other factors were important as they helped to build tensions across all aspects of Russian society, it was a spark like Bloody Sunday that was ultimately needed in order to bind all the population at once in anger to attempt to overthrow the Tsar.' (Summary of argument).

1 mark was awarded for the conclusion as the candidate makes only a summary of points made.

Historical context: 3/3

Use of knowledge: 6/6

Analysis: 5/6

Evaluation: 0/4

Conclusion: 1/3

Total: 15/22

Candidate 3

Question 27: To what extent did the Nazis stay in power due to the popularity of their social policies, 1933-1939?

The candidate was awarded **16 marks** for this question as follows:

Introduction

The candidate gives background to the issue in the first three sentences. Plenty of background is presented.

Factors are listed by the candidate: 'The establishment of a totalitarian state, fear and state terror, the use of propaganda, Hitler's dynamic foreign policy, and Nazi social policies.'

The candidate establishes a line of argument: 'It can be argued that although the Nazis' social policies were important, the main reason why the Nazis were able to stay in power was due to fear and state terror as it coerced people into absolute obedience to Nazi authority.'

The introduction was awarded **3 (historical context) marks** as the candidate establishes at least two points of relevant background to the issue and identifies key factors and connects these to the line of argument in response to the issue.

Paragraph 1: Establishment of a totalitarian state

The candidate starts with a signpost sentence. (No mark is given for this, but it is good practice): 'The Nazis stayed in power partly due to their establishment of a totalitarian state.'

Knowledge point awarded for: 'The Reichstag Fire in February 1933 enabled Hitler to secure both Article 48 - which suspended all constitutional civil rights - and the Enabling Act, which allowed Hitler to rule without parliament.'

Analysis point awarded for: 'This was important as it gave Hitler the power he needed to pass laws to remove all political parties and organisations opposed to him, thereby allowing him to take full control in Germany. Indeed, this was "a significant move on the road to dictatorship" (Frank McDonough).'

Knowledge point awarded for: 'However, even with the SPD banned or "missing", the Nazis were still unable to win a majority vote in 1933 showing there was still large opposition towards the Nazis that they would need to fight against.'

Analysis point awarded for: 'Therefore, the crushing of opposition through the establishment of a one-party state was clearly not enough for the Nazis to stay in power.'

Paragraph 2: Fear and state terrorism

The candidate starts with a signpost sentence. (No mark is given for this, but it is good practice): 'Fear and state terror was another reason why the Nazis were able to stay in power between 1933 and 1939.'

Knowledge point awarded for 'The SS was the state's internal security service and it ran concentration camps where those who opposed Nazi ideology were sent to be "reeducated".'

Knowledge point awarded for 'The Gestapo was the state's secret police who used torture to gain confessions from people'.

Analysis point awarded for: 'The roles of the SS and Gestapo were important as their brutal acts of oppression created a system of fear which the Nazis used to control people and coerce them into accepting and obeying Nazi rule'.

Developed analysis point awarded for 'However, the fact that 160,000 Germans acted as informants suggests that there was a willingness to co-operate with the state.'

Paragraph 3: Propaganda

The candidate starts with a signpost sentence. (No mark is given for this, but it is good practice): 'As propaganda minister, Joseph Goebbels took control of all aspects of the media in Germany.'

Knowledge point awarded for 'Newspapers were censored and used to spread Nazi government news, and radio became a key tool for indoctrination and was used to broadcast Hitler's key speeches.'

Analysis point awarded for: 'The use of propaganda was important as it could not be avoided living in Nazi Germany, which helped to spread Nazi beliefs and persuade people into supporting the regime.'

Developed analysis point awarded for: 'However, it could be argued that fear and state terror was more important than the use of propaganda as the system of fear in place would have stifled people's true opinions, and therefore it would be too simplistic to believe that propaganda alone was enough for the Nazis' maintenance of power.'

Paragraph 4: Social policies

Within this paragraph the candidate discusses Nazi social policy. However, they only refer to youth organisations.

The candidate starts with a signpost sentence. (No mark is given for this, but it is good practice): 'One of the Nazis' social policy was to indoctrinate the young.'

Knowledge point awarded for 'The Nazis set up youth organisations such as Hitler Youth to prepare boys for military service and the League of German Maidens to prepare girls for motherhood.'

No analysis mark awarded for following sentence as it does not meet the aims of the question: 'On the one hand, it is traditionally viewed that many of these young people were willing participants.'

Knowledge point awarded for: 'However, on the other hand, many had in fact joined opposition groups such as the Edelweiss Pirates and the White Rose, and by December 1936 the Nazis had to take the step of making participation compulsory.'

Developed analysis point awarded for: 'Therefore, it is clear that the Nazis social policies were not as popular and could not have won over the youth in Germany and thus, it would be exaggerating to argue that the Nazis stayed in power solely due to the popularity of their social policies.'

Paragraph 5: Foreign policy

The candidate opens this paragraph with a signpost sentence where a **knowledge point** is awarded for: 'Much of Hitler's popularity rested on his achievements in foreign policy which included the remilitarisation of the Rhineland in 1936, the Anschluss with Austria in 1938 and the takeover of the Sudetenland from Czechoslovakia.'

Analysis point awarded for: 'Hitler's dynamic foreign policy was important as it showed Hitler to be reversing the humiliation of the Treaty of Versailles, which was hugely popular amongst German people who hated the Diktat, and therefore this increased support for the Nazi regime.'

Developed analysis point awarded for: 'However, not everyone in Germany supported Hitler's foreign policy as many thought he was in fact leading Germany into another war - the fact that the Nazis published propaganda after the invasion of Sudetenland claiming "we thank our leader" shows that they had to <u>convince</u> the German people that they were thankful.'

Conclusion

'In conclusion, although the Nazis' social policies were important, the extent to which its popularity was the reason why the Nazis stayed in power is very limited. (This is the only reference to the isolated factor in the conclusion). Indeed, the most important reason why the Nazis stayed in power was due to fear and state terror through the use of the SS and Gestapo as this coerced the German people into staying quiet and to obey Nazi rule. The second most important reason was the use of propaganda as people were bombarded with Nazi messages which gained the loyalty of the German people. (This brings a bit of balance between factors, but not between arguments). Nevertheless, fear and state terror was more important as people would do anything to avoid being sent to a concentration camp, and so were prepared to go along with the Nazis even if they opposed their ideology.' (The conclusion is really a summary, with very little written about the isolated factor.)

1 mark was awarded for the conclusion as the candidate makes only a summary of points made.

Historical context: 3/3

Use of knowledge: 6/6

Analysis: 6/6

Evaluation: 0/4

Conclusion: 1/3

Total: 16/22

Candidate 4

Question 34: Social fears were the main reason for changing attitudes towards immigration in the 1920s. How valid is this view?

The candidate was awarded 18 marks for this question as follows:

Introduction

In the first four sentences, the candidate discusses the background to the issue: 'Before the 1920s ... "open door policy"... allowed virtually anyone into the country. However, in 1921 the Emergency Quota Act was passed ...'.

Line of argument is given: 'The view that 'social fears were the main reason for changing attitude'... is valid to a certain extent, however the main reason why attitudes were changing was due to an increase in prejudice and racism.'

Factors are also given: 'Social fears were important, however prejudice and racism was the most important, with other significant factors such as fear of revolution and isolationism also contributing.'

The introduction was awarded **3 (historical context) marks** as the candidate establishes at least two points of relevant background to the issue and identifies key factors and connects these to the line of argument in response to the issue.

Paragraph 1: Social fears

The candidate starts with a signpost sentence. (No mark is given for this, but it is good practice): 'The view that 'social fears were the main reason for changing attitudes to immigration in the 1920s' is valid to a certain extent, as social fears contributed to the rise in suspicion towards immigrant minorities in America.'

Knowledge point awarded for: 'High crime rates were beginning to be blamed on immigrant numbers, as crime rates increased in the country alongside immigrant numbers.'

Analysis point awarded for: 'This was important as it demonstrated the view that many white Americans possessed; that immigrants were largely inherent criminals; and much of America's crime would be caused solely by them.'

Knowledge point awarded for the next two sentences: 'Sacco and Vancetti were two Italian immigrants, put on trial for robbery and murder. They were convicted on largely circumstantial evidence by who were an all-white jury.'

No marks were awarded for the next sentence as it does not meet the aims of the question: 'This proves how eager people were to pin crimes on immigrants.'

Developed analysis point awarded for the next two sentences which bring in a counterargument: 'However on the other hand, social fears had less of an impact on changing attitudes as charity workers and social workers were responsible for highlighting the real causes of crime, which was down to loneliness, terrible living conditions and poverty. This proved that crime rates would be evident even in the absence of immigrants.'

Developed analysis point awarded for the next three sentences. Although this is an attempt at evaluation and brings in the line of argument, it is repetitive and confused but does show another counter argument: 'Therefore the view is valid, however not completely valid as prejudice and racism was the main reason. This is because social workers also had proved that the vast majority of crimes committed by immigrants were petty crimes such as theft, and so it proved that immigrants had someone on their side. Prejudice and racism however was prevalent throughout society and meant that little people would fight to defend immigrants.'

Paragraph 2: Prejudice and racism

The candidate starts with a signpost sentence. (No mark is given for this, but it is good practice): 'Prejudice and racism was the main reason that attitudes towards immigrants changed in the 1920s.'

Knowledge point awarded for: 'The White Anglo-Saxon Protestants (WASPs) were a group of original settlers from Western European countries who didn't want their life being influenced by Southern and Eastern European immigrants who did not share the culture or religion.'

Knowledge point awarded for: 'The... KKK were established in the 1860s following the abolishment of the slave trade, but saw a revival by 1915. By 1925 they peaked at 5 million members.'

Analysis point awarded for: 'This was important as it showed the huge percentage of the country who had largely prejudiced views on immigrants.'

Knowledge point awarded for: 'Not only this, but many respected members of the community were involved with the KKK. These included policemen, sheriffs and ministers.'

Analysis point awarded for: 'This gave the impression that the KKK were worthy of support, and made it increasingly hard to fight against them as huge numbers of the public had KKK connections.'

Developed analysis point awarded for: 'However on the other hand, by 1929 the KKK had reached under one million members, and by the 1930s under 30,000. This was evidence of extreme white superiorism was dying out, as were concerns regarding immigrants.'

The final point the candidate makes is speculative so not credited: 'Despite this, prejudice and racism was more important than social fears, as President Warren G Harding was believed to be a secret member of the KKK – which proved how widespread they were. Social fears were largely based on the views and ideas of groups such as the KKK and therefore weren't as significant.'

Paragraph 3: Fear of revolution

The candidate starts with a signpost sentence. (No mark is given for this, but it is good practice): 'Fear of revolution was another important factor that makes the view that 'social fears were the main reason for changing attitudes towards immigration'... less valid.'

Knowledge point awarded for: 'In 1917, Russia had undergone a communist revolution which massively contradicted the idea of the 'American Dream'.'

Analysis point awarded for: 'This made people cautious of immigrants, as they feared a revolution initiated by immigrants because it threatened the livelihood of those who had done well for themselves in America.'

Knowledge point awarded for: 'Mitchell Palmer was the top US law enforcement officer at the time who led raids to arrest and deport approximately 6000 alleged subversives.'

Analysis point awarded for the next two sentences: 'This was important as it showed the extent at which the government was prepared to go to in order to avoid a communist revolt. It only developed the anxiety already contained within the US public, as it made them feel like they had something to fear if the government was going to such lengths.'

Developed analysis point awarded for: 'However this was less significant as Mitchell Palmer had presidential ambitions, and so needed to be seen as a good leader – and so exaggerated the real chance of a communist revolution.'

Developed analysis point awarded for: 'Subsequently, the fear of revolution was less important in the changing attitudes towards immigration as the fear of revolution was relatively short term, as by the 1st of May the revolution Palmer had predicted never came to anything. Prejudice and racism was much more of an ongoing issue and lasted for a much longer period of time, as the KKK still exist in their small numbers today.'

Although this may be an attempt at evaluation it was thought that the candidate was developing the analysis point above so was awarded a developed analysis point.

Paragraph 4: Isolationism

The candidate starts with a signpost sentence. (No mark is given for this, but it is good practice): 'A final reason why the view isn't entirely valid is because isolationism also contributed to the changing attitudes in the US.'

Knowledge point awarded for: 'In World War One, America had lost over 116,000 troops, even after being slow and reluctant to get involved in the first place.'

Knowledge point awarded for: 'On top of this, many 1st wave immigrants had been from Western European countries such as Germany and Britain, and so at the outbreak of WW1 divisions in society were created. German houses and businesses were targeted, and German culture was boycotted.'

Analysis point awarded for: 'Because of this, America had the intention of isolating itself from foreign influence, as a means to prevent further conflict and separation within communities.'

Developed analysis point awarded for the next two sentences: 'However, the WW1 experience towards immigrants wasn't all bad in America – liberty bonds were encouraged to be bought by immigrants, which they did in their thousands. This was a vital contribution to the war effort, that demonstrated the relationship between immigrant minorities and US citizens could be one of peace.'

Conclusion

'In conclusion, the view that 'social fears were the main reason for changing attitudes towards immigration in the 1920s' is valid, but only to a certain extent. The accurate main reason was because of an increase in prejudice and racism throughout America. (Judgement) This was more important than isolationism, as the war effort made by immigrants through the Liberty Bonds was one of significance whereas prejudice and racism caused them to oversee this war effort as they possessed their racially discriminatory views. (Relative judgement indicating line of argument as the most **important factor)** The fear of revolution only went so far in influencing changing attitudes as it was relatively short term, as the fear of revolution fizzled out as it never came to anything. This compared to prejudice and racism, which is still evident in society proves that it had much more of an influence over changing attitudes. (Relative judgement indicating line of argument as the most important factor) The view is partially correct, as social fears were important as high crime rates were often associated with increasing immigrant numbers, however social fears weren't as important as prejudice and racism. This is because social and charity workers publicised the real cause of high crime in America, proving that immigrants had someone to stand against the stereotype regarding social fears. Prejudice and racism however was common on some form throughout the community, and people based their social fears off common racially prejudiced ideas. (Relative judgment indicating line of argument as the most important factor) Therefore, the view is not completely valid as prejudice and racism was the main reason for changing attitudes towards immigration in the 1920s. This is because the rise and existence of groups such as the KKK and the WASPS spread a negative and dishonest representation of the role of immigrants within American society, and impacted every American citizen to a certain extent. (Judgement)

3 marks were awarded for the conclusion as the candidate make a relative overall judgement between the different factors in relation to the issue and explains how this arises from their evaluation of the presented evidence.

Historical context 3/3
Use of knowledge 6/6
Analysis 6/6
Evaluation 0/4
Conclusion 3/3
Total 18/22