

Commentary on candidate evidence

The candidate evidence has achieved the following marks for each question of this course assessment component, the assignment.

Candidate 1

Title: To what extent did the Labour welfare reforms improve the lives of those in Britain, between 1945 and 1951?

The candidate was awarded **29 out of 30 marks** for this assignment.

Introduction

- ◆ The candidate gives good background to the issue in first few sentences: In 1945, the Labour Party took control ...Churchill lost ...His successor was Attlee ...over their 6 year period ...variety of reforms, addressing the '5 giants' ...in Beveridge Report. **(1 mark)**
- ◆ All essay factors are listed: Want, Disease, Ignorance, Squalor and Idleness. **(1 mark)**
- ◆ The candidate provides a line of argument: 'Labour welfare reforms were successful' **(1 mark)**

Paragraph 1

- ◆ The candidate opens the paragraph with a signpost sentence 'The giant of 'Want' was tackled by numerous reforms...' No marks are given but it is good practice and introduces the problem of poverty'
- ◆ **Knowledge point:** 'In 1945, the Family Allowance Act provided a benefit for mothers ...5 shillings for every child after the first born.'
- ◆ **Reference point:** Pugh quote linked to previous point of KU. "...cost-effective ways of relieving hardship."
- ◆ **Knowledge point:** 'In 1946 the National Insurance Act ...workers would pay into scheme and receive benefits like old-age pensions, sickness and unemployment benefits.'
- ◆ **Analysis point:** 'This was important ...safety net to those who needed it.'
- ◆ **Knowledge point:** 'National Assistance Act was passed in 1948 which was where means test were introduced to assess how much assistance the unemployed and lowly paid could receive'.
- ◆ **Analysis point:** 'This is important, provided safety net for those that didn't qualify for national insurance ...'
- ◆ **Analysis+ point:** 'However ...government didn't take into account that inflation would occur so amounts weren't enough.'

- ◆ **Analysis+ point:** Furthermore ...national insurance was 5% of ...pay, so they became poorer as a result.
- ◆ **Evaluation + point** linked to line of argument (LoA) in that the Labour reforms were successful: 'In evaluation, the reforms ...carried out to varying extents, provided an essential amount financial aid but it wasn't immediately beneficial ...means tests also caused embarrassment ...hindering the impact of reforms; But the reforms ...clearly dealt with poverty ...2% poverty level ...compared to 36% ...dramatic positive effect ...'

Paragraph 2

- ◆ The candidate opens the paragraph with a signpost sentence 'One of the most successful giants tackled, disease' No marks are given but it is good practice and introduces the problem of poor health.
- ◆ **Knowledge point:** '5th July 1948, the National Health Service was introduced ...three principles: Universal access, free services and comprehensiveness. It provided free optical care, free dental care and free prescriptions.'
- ◆ **Knowledge point:** The necessity for care can be shown ...increase in ...prescription orders ...7million to 13.5 million by September 1948.'
- ◆ **Analysis point:** 'This is important, as the sheer number of people taking the care offered showed intensity of Britain's health problem.'
- ◆ **Analysis point:** 'The NHS can be shown to have helped people ... September 1948 ...an order of 5 million pairs of glasses and a rise to 8 million dental patients.'
- ◆ **Analysis + point:** 'However, by 1951 NHS was struggling financially ...introduce prescription fees.'
- ◆ **Reference point** from Morrison: Morrison and Monaghan with supporting explanation: " The NHS failed to improve general medical service available to the bulk of the population."
- ◆ Explanation of quote: 'This shows the alternative view that the NHS wasn't able to fulfil its potential ...between 1945 and 1951.'
- ◆ **Evaluation+ point:** linked to LoA in that the Labour reforms were successful: In evaluation, the NHS was ultimately a victim of its own success ...Overall, the Labour welfare reforms improved ...lives'

Paragraph 3

- ◆ The candidate opens the paragraph with a signpost sentence 'reforms to deal with education' No marks are given but it is good practice and introduces the problem of poor education.
- ◆ **Knowledge point:** 1944 Education Act brought in, children in school until 15, as well as free meals and medical inspections.
- ◆ **Knowledge point:** 'An array of smaller ...acts ...planning for schools to accommodate more pupils due to increased attendance.'
- ◆ **Knowledge point:** 'A test ...at age 11 to determine...grammar or secondary school.'

- ◆ **Analysis point:** 'This is important as the tiered system ...meant each child received ...tailored education' best suited to them.
- ◆ **Analysis + point:** 'However, the working-class children lacked ...resources that middle-class children were able to afford, so ...tended to receive lesser education, meaning their lives were not improved as their career paths after school were limited.'
- ◆ **Evaluation+ point:** linked to LoA in that the Labour reforms were successful: 'In evaluation, there was an improvement in social mobility as children were forced to stay in education longer. However ...Despite this ...RJ Cootes, he says "The 1944 Act, did, however, go a long way towards removing wealth as a direct influence on state secondary education" (**reference point**) ...Overall, reforms dealing with education were slightly successful ...at least provided a basic education that hadn't been there prior to reforms.' In this part of the answer the quote is integral to the success of the evaluation. You cannot credit the source reference twice in this situation. The credit in this instance is for evaluation.

Paragraph 4

- ◆ The candidate opens the paragraph with a signpost sentence 'The welfare reforms dealt with giant of Squalor, to improve housing. ...' No marks are given but it is good practice and introduces the problem of poor housing
- ◆ **Knowledge point:** 'In 1946, the New Towns Act was passed ...planning of 14 new towns in the East Kilbride and Glenrothes area in an attempt to reduce overcrowding.'
- ◆ **Knowledge point:** 'The government also brought in prefabs ...by 1951 there were 200,000 being built a year.'
- ◆ **Knowledge point:** 'The Housing Act ...1949 ...council could buy housing in disrepair ...allowed slums to be evicted so they could be destroyed.'
- ◆ **Analysis point:** 'This is important ...health of inhabitants to improve ... moved away from inner city pollutants ...provided a great sense of safety ...a place they could call home.'
- ◆ **Analysis+ point:** However, by 1951 there was still a very long waiting list ... shortage of housing ...Families had taken to squatting in aerodromes.'
- ◆ **Evaluation+ point :** linked to LoA in that the Labour reforms were successful: 'housing was the least effectively dealt with ...still a great amount of homelessness ...However, with lack of money ...RJ Cootes agrees ...great progress had been made'"(**reference point**) ...supported by ...Labour ...14 news towns by 1951 ...Overall ...reforms did improve some of the lives ...' This paragraph can be credited with two marks, as even without the quote the evaluation would stand so it is awarded an evaluation+ and it is picking up a relevant source reference point.

Paragraph 5

The candidate opens the paragraph with a signpost sentence 'Finally, Idleness was tackled ...' No marks are given but it is good practice and introduces the problem of unemployment.

- ◆ **Knowledge point:** ‘Nationalisation was introduced ...government took control of certain industries ...coal, steel, iron and railway industry.’
- ◆ **Knowledge point:** ‘There was an improvement in pay and working conditions ...exploitation was addressed ...jobs were ...created and maintained.’
- ◆ **Analysis point:** ‘This is important ...profit from these industries allowed government to help a larger group of individuals rather than a private owner helping one individual.’
- ◆ **Reference point.** Thornes quote “real success of post-war years was... maintenance of full employment” correctly on resource sheet and referenced.
- ◆ Explanation of quote (no mark given): ‘This evidence shows ...sustainment of employment that helped the most people.’
- ◆ **Analysis+ point:** However ...poor management of nationalisation in the beginning ...problems for the scheme long-term.’
- ◆ **Evaluation+ point:** linked to LoA in that the Labour reforms were successful: ‘some improvement in the lives of those in Britain ... by 1946, unemployment had been reduced by 2.5% ...nearly full employment reached. However, it was debatable whether this was direct result of the Labour welfare reforms ... Overall ...lives ...improved.’

Conclusion

- ◆ Summary sentence reflecting line of argument: ‘In conclusion ...reforms successfully improved ...lives.’
- ◆ Additional summative sentence: ‘...variety and large number of reforms, a large chunk of Britain’s problems and the five giants were able to be dealt with effectively.’
- ◆ Positive comment only on issue of Want: ‘...financial support ...through family allowances and national insurance was extremely beneficial.’
- ◆ Negative comment only on issue of Squalor: ‘However ...housing dealt with poorly ...too few houses ...in Britain.’
- ◆ Negative comment only on issue of Ignorance: ‘...very evident class divide in education, restricting lower classes from higher paid jobs.’
- ◆ Both positive and negative comments on issue of Idleness: ‘...nationalisation of industries showed mixed results ...improvement in working conditions but in long run the scheme didn’t work extremely well.’
- ◆ Positive comment only on issue of Disease: ‘...undeniable ...achievement ... the establishment of the National Health Service ...’
- ◆ Reference used well to finish conclusion (no reference mark given in a conclusion): ‘Overall ...reforms ...demonstrated ...positive affect ...improving life ...RJ Cootes agrees ...‘Five giants was vigorously attacked, with great success.’

Although the conclusion contains a balance in the sense of positive and negative comments on Labour reforms in general, only Idleness is dealt with in a balanced way within itself. For 3 out of 3, given that the line of argument was ‘the Labour welfare reforms were successful’, with no qualification ‘to an extent’ etc, the conclusion would have to contain more positive comments than negative ones.

Introduction 3 (context, factors, line of argument)
Analysis 7 (7 Analysis and 6 Analysis+)
Evaluation 5 (Evaluation+)
References 4 (all cited correctly in the resource sheet)
Knowledge 8 (13 Knowledge)
Conclusion 2 (more than a summary, a balanced view is given, but overall judgement is not based on the evidence presented)

Total 29 out of 30 marks

Candidate 2

Title: To what extent was fear and terror the main reason for the Nazis maintaining power between 1933-39?

This candidate was awarded **17 out of 30 marks** for this assignment.

Introduction

- ◆ The candidate provides 2 points of background on the issue. 'In 1933 Hitler became the chancellor of Germany despite having a minority government of just over 30% After spending some time in prison... writing 'Mein Kampf' (1 mark)
- ◆ All essay factors are listed: fear and terror, propaganda, social policies and economic factors. (1 mark)
- ◆ The candidate provides a line of argument: 'From this the conclusion will be drawn that fear and terror was the most important factor for the Nazis remaining in power'. (1 mark)

Paragraph 1

- ◆ The candidate opens the paragraph with a signpost sentence 'The first factor to consider...' No marks are given but it is good practice and introduces fear and state terrorism.
- ◆ No Knowledge point awarded for comments related to 'final solution' as this was 1941.
- ◆ **Knowledge point:** 'Concentration camps differed in use but are mainly associated with forced labour and killing those who were sent there'.
- ◆ **Analysis point:** 'This was important because it caused the public to fear the Nazis, giving them more control'.
- ◆ **Knowledge point:** 'Groups such as the Edelweiss pirates and Swingjugend publically opposed the Nazis'.
- ◆ No Reference mark awarded. Websites and book given on plan, but no quote.
- ◆ **Knowledge point:** 'Also, the secret state police or gestapo were used to monitor and spy on the public'.
- ◆ **Analysis point:** 'This was important because this stopped many from opposing the Nazis and speaking against them'.

- ◆ No mark awarded for attempt at Evaluation: A repetition of previous points.

Paragraph 2

- ◆ The candidate opens the paragraph with a signpost sentence 'The second factor to consider...' No marks are given but it is good practice and introduces propaganda.
- ◆ **Knowledge point:** 'Propaganda was used to brainwash the German public by using speeches, poster and rallies'.
- ◆ **Analysis point:** 'This was important because it allowed the Nazi party to gain more support and keep the country under Nazi control'.
- ◆ **Knowledge point:** Hitler was a great speaker and gained a lot of the Nazi's support through this method. Even at home, people were listening to Nazi propaganda and slowly began to support the party'.
- ◆ **Analysis+ point:** 'However, many historians argue about the effectiveness of Propaganda. Most people ignored the posters and were aware that Nazis were selective with what the public could and could not know'.
- ◆ **Knowledge point:** 'Also in 1936 the Berlin Olympics was used as a propaganda event to show off German and Aryan superiority'.
- ◆ No Reference mark awarded. Websites and book given on plan, but no quote
- ◆ No Analysis awarded. Too little detail.
- ◆ No marks awarded for Jesse Owens comment.
- ◆ No marks awarded for attempt at evaluation.

Paragraph 3

- ◆ The candidate opens the paragraph with a signpost sentence 'The third factor to consider...' No marks are given but it is good practice and introduces social policies
- ◆ **Knowledge point:** 'Anti-Nazi teachers, lawyers, and doctors were all eliminated and the Nazis used the police, churches and youth groups in order to keep control of the German public'.
- ◆ No marks awarded for the following: 'This was important because this meant that no one could not be associated with the Nazi party. From a young age Germans were taught Nazi views and that anyone that opposed them would be sent away. This made many Germans accept the regime in order to survive. However, counter groups were set up such as the edelweiss pirates'.
- ◆ **Knowledge point:** 'It is estimated that 800,000 opposed the Nazis and 500,000 died due to their beliefs'.
- ◆ No reference mark awarded
- ◆ **Knowledge point:** 'Gobbles was the minister of propaganda and the quotes shows how the Nazis wanted women to act as mothers and homemakers "seen but not heard".'
- ◆ **Knowledge point:** 'Also some women worked as SS members such as Irma Grese, Herta Bothe and Maria Mandel'.
- ◆ No Reference mark awarded. Websites and book given on plan, but no quote.

- ◆ No evaluation awarded. Repetition.

Paragraph 4

- ◆ The candidate opens the paragraph with a signpost sentence 'The final factor to consider...' No marks are given but it is good practice and introduces economic policies.
- ◆ **Knowledge point:** 'The Nazis party was able to reduce the unemployment rate to 0% by 1939, however this figure did not include women, Jews and 'non-Aryans.'
- ◆ **Analysis point:** 'This was important because it gave some Germans a reason to like the Nazis. They were employed which meant they had money and had new roads as well as a good economy'.
- ◆ No more marks are awarded as the remainder of the paragraph is confused.

Conclusion

Overall, the candidate provides a basic summary of factors.

Introduction: 3 (context, line of argument and factors)

Analysis: 5 (4 Analysis 1 Analysis+)

Evaluation: 0

References: 0

Knowledge: 8 (12 knowledge)

Conclusion: 1 (No more than a summary)

Total: 17 out of 30 marks

Candidate 3

Title: How important was the Wall Street Crash as a cause of the Great Depression?

The candidate was awarded **21 out of 30 marks** for this assignment.

Introduction

- ◆ Good background in the first 8 lines up to '...half of all school children.' **(1 mark)**
- ◆ All essay factors then listed: Next 4 sentences up to '...under consumption of goods' **(1 mark)**
- ◆ Line of argument: Addresses the isolated factor in the question. **(1 mark)**

Paragraph 1

- ◆ The candidate opens the paragraph with a signpost sentence 'The Wall Street Crash was an important cause...' No marks are given but it is good practice and introduces the isolated factor, the Wall Street Crash.
- ◆ **Knowledge point:** '...played the stockmarket.'
- ◆ **Knowledge point:** '...in order to buy shares.'

- ◆ **Knowledge point:** '... issued as a result.'
- ◆ **Knowledge point:** '... the public about such loans.'
- ◆ Next sentence is an attempted Analysis+ but is not credited as it doesn't relate the knowledge presented in the paragraph.
- ◆ **Knowledge point:** '...were beginning to fall by 10am.'
- ◆ Attempted reference point in the next sentence but is not credited as it is factual rather than an opinion or argument. There is also no author credited on the reference sheet.
- ◆ **Knowledge point:** '...shares had been sold.'
- ◆ **Knowledge point:** '...paper profits was wiped out.'
- ◆ **Analysis point:** '...no hard action to step in.'
- ◆ **Analysis+ point:** '... entirely to blame for the depression.' credited as Analysis + with a point of
- ◆ **Knowledge point:** '...living below the poverty line.'
- ◆ **Analysis+ point:** '...from the short term large profits.'
- ◆ The last part of the paragraph is an attempt at evaluation, however, it is not credited as it is a repetition of what has already been argued.

Paragraph 2

- ◆ The candidate opens the paragraph with a signpost sentence 'The weaknesses in the US banking system...' No marks are given but it is good practice and introduces the weaknesses of the US banking system .
- ◆ **Knowledge point:** '...the purchase of goods.'
- ◆ **Analysis point:** '...on a day to day basis.'
- ◆ **Knowledge point:** '...at a similar time.'
- ◆ **Analysis point:** Next 3 sentences credited as the same point of analysis up to '...per year in the 1920s.'
- ◆ Attempted reference point in the next sentence but is not credited as there is also no author credited on the reference sheet.
- ◆ **Knowledge point:** '...they simply couldn't.'
- ◆ **Analysis point:** '...unregulated credit was significant.'
- ◆ **Analysis+ point:** '...the policies of the Republican Government.'

Paragraph 3

- ◆ The candidate opens the paragraph with a signpost sentence 'Overproduction and underconsumption was another important cause of the depression' No marks are given but it is good practice and introduces the overproduction of goods and underconsumption .
- ◆ **Knowledge point :** '...to 23 million by 1929.'
- ◆ **Knowledge point:** '...huge increase in the 1920s.'
- ◆ **Knowledge point:** '...buy the promoted products.'
- ◆ **Analysis+ point:** '...and allowed by the Government.'
- ◆ **Knowledge point:** '...for a level of comfort.'
- ◆ **Knowledge point:** '...called 'saturation of the market'.'

- ◆ **Analysis point:** '...was a failure to notice that.'
- ◆ Attempted reference point in the next sentence but is not credited as it is factual rather than an opinion or argument.
- ◆ **Analysis+ point:** '...credit but failed to do so.'
- ◆ Next sentence is confused therefore no marks were awarded.
- ◆ **Evaluation+ point:** Evaluation which brings in the line of argument that it was the policies of the Republican government which was the most important cause of the Great Depression

Paragraph 4

- ◆ The candidate opens the paragraph with a signpost sentence 'The policies of the republican government were also an important factor of the Great Depression' No marks are given but it is good practice and introduces the Republican government policies in the 1920s.
- ◆ **Knowledge point:** '...to in order to stimulate spending.'
- ◆ **Knowledge point:** '...cut public spending by 50%.'
- ◆ **Analysis point:** '...they could not afford goods anyway.'
- ◆ **Knowledge point:** '...receive support when in need.'
- ◆ Attempted reference point in the next sentence but is not credited as it is factual rather than an opinion or argument.
- ◆ **Knowledge point:** '...billion over 7 years.'
- ◆ **Analysis point'** '...regardless of high unemployment or other market issues.'
- ◆ The last part of the paragraph is an attempt at evaluation; however, it is not credited as it is a repetition of what has already been argued.

Conclusion

Conclusion makes an overall judgment and supports this. It also brings in some balance highlighting the limitations of the other factors.

Introduction: (Context, LoA and Factors)	3
Analysis: (7 Analysis and 5 Analysis+)	7
Evaluation: (1 Evaluation+)	1
References: (no references credited)	0
Knowledge: (20 Knowledge)	8
Conclusion: (Judgment with balance)	2
Total	21 out of 30 marks