

Commentary on candidate evidence

The candidate evidence has achieved the following marks for each question of the question paper.

Candidate 1

Section 1 – Scottish Text: *In Mrs Tilscher’s Class* by Carol Ann Duffy

The candidate was awarded **19 out of 20 marks** for this section.

Question 37

The candidate was awarded **2 out of 2 marks** for this question.

The first point, ‘mess about and play’ suggesting that the children have ‘lots of energy’, is an acceptable comment on “running child”. It was awarded **1 mark**.

The next point suggesting school is a ‘happy and fun place to be’ which ‘evokes eagerness’ is an acceptable comment on “laugh of a bell”. It was awarded **1 mark**.

NB although the candidate uses ‘excitement’ (which is in the question), the answer does not rely on this.

Question 38

The candidate was awarded **3 out of 4 marks** for this question.

The first point, the ‘vibrant’ atmosphere of a classroom that is ‘full of life’, is an acceptable comment on “glowed like a sweetshop”. It was awarded **1 mark**.

The next point, ‘interesting ...engaging and fun’, is an acceptable comment on “enthraling”. It was awarded **1 mark**.

The next point is an attempt to comment on “Mrs Tilscher loved you”. However, ‘satisfied’ is not a strong enough comment to convey the joyful atmosphere (as required by the question) and ‘love’ is lifted from the text. It was awarded 0 marks.

The final point, ‘children are being encouraged to be free and mess around’ is an acceptable comment on “xylophone’s nonsense”. It was awarded **1 mark**.

Question 39

The candidate was awarded **4 out of 4 marks** for this question.

The first point, 'clearly wasn't said in a kind manner', is an acceptable comment on "rough boy". It was awarded **1 mark**.

The second point, 'disgusted ...didn't want to believe' is an acceptable comment on "appalled". It was awarded **1 mark**.

The third point, 'dynamics between a teacher and pupil change as they grow up, and how they lose a close relationship' is an acceptable comment on "turned away". It was awarded **1 mark**.

The fourth point is an attempt to comment on "Reports were handed out". The comment however is merely assertion. It was awarded 0 marks.

The final point, 'overwhelmed with emotion ...feelings are unpleasant and annoying' is an acceptable comment on "untidy, hot, fractious". It was awarded **1 mark**.

Question 40

The candidate was awarded **10 out of 10 marks** for this question.

Commonality

The candidate identifies areas of commonality by referring to *In Mrs Tilscher's Class* and *Originally*.

The first point on *In Mrs Tilscher's Class*, about the experience of 'growing up ...changes to life' is an acceptable comment on how the central concern of 'loss of innocence' is explored. It was awarded **1 mark**.

The second point on *Originally*, about the experience of 'moving countries' is an acceptable comment on how the central concern of 'losses of identity' is explored. It was awarded **1 mark**.

NB The candidate has already achieved full marks for Commonality. However, if required, the comment on *The Way My Mother Speaks* about how the experience of 'moving away from a mother ...becoming more independent' is used to explore the central concern of 'loss of self-security', could be awarded 1 mark when considered as an 'Elsewhere' point.

Extract

The point that the 'unsettling' experience of growing up is used to explore the central concern of loss of innocence, is a detailed comment on "sky split open into a thunderstorm" and the contrast of "a tangible alarm"/ "the laugh of a bell". It was awarded **2 marks**.

Elsewhere

NB At the start of the commonality section, the candidate's intention to consider Duffy's exploration of the central concerns of change and loss is made clear. Some of the candidate's comments made in the 'Elsewhere' section are clearly linked to this earlier identification of central concerns.

The point that the speaker's 'tie to their Scottish heratige ...is slipping' and that this loss of identity is a process which is 'natural and inescapable' is a detailed comment on "my tongue shedding its skin like a snake". It was awarded **2 marks**.

The next point that the experience of moving has led to confusion and a loss of identity is an acceptable comment on "Originally? And I hesitate." It was awarded **1 mark**.

The point that 'becoming independent' makes the speaker 'less comforted' and in need of her mother's words to lessen the impact of change/loss is an acceptable comment on "Under the shallows of my breath". It was awarded **1 mark**.

The point on the speaker's conflicting feelings and loss of self-security after the move is an acceptable comment on "Homesick, free and in love". It was awarded **1 mark**.

The final point on *Mrs Midas* on the loss of 'the bond in the relationship' is an acceptable comment on "separate beds". It was awarded **1 mark**.