

Commentary on candidate evidence

The candidate evidence has achieved the following marks for each question of the critical reading question paper.

Candidate 3

The candidate was awarded a total of **14 out of 20 marks** for this section of the question paper.

Question 45: Look at lines 1-3. Analyse how the poet's use of language conveys a tense mood.

The candidate was awarded **1 mark**.

The first point on "(too often)" suggesting the experience is one he does not wish to repeat is an acceptable comment. It was awarded **1 mark**.

0 marks were awarded for the next point on "slounge" as the comment 'slow and lazy movement' does not create tension.

Question 46: Look at lines 4-9. By referring to at least two examples, analyse how the poet's use of language conveys the speaker's thoughts on the experience.

The candidate was awarded **4 marks**.

The first point on "I count as gain" suggesting the experience has been 'beneficial to him' is an acceptable comment. It was awarded **1 mark**.

The next point on "I met" suggesting that the encounter with the shark was 'civilised' is an acceptable comment and was awarded **1 mark**.

The third point on “roomsized monster ... matchbox brain” conveying the incongruity of the creature which was ‘not a threat even though he appears to be’ is an acceptable comment. It was awarded **1 mark**.

The final point is an acceptable comment on “Centuries back” suggesting the encounter prompts the speaker to reflect on ‘humanity’s own evolution’ and was awarded **1 mark**.

Question 47: Look at lines 10-15. By referring to at least two examples, analyse how the poet’s use of language reveals moments of realisation for the speaker.

The candidate was awarded **3 marks**.

0 marks were awarded for the first point on “dirt” as the focus is on the literal meaning of the word.

The next point on “So who’s the monster?” suggesting that, despite the shark’s appearance, ‘humans are capable of much worse’ is an acceptable comment. It was awarded **1 mark**.

The third point on “emerging from the slime of everything” suggesting that ‘we all came from the same place’ and ‘humans have evolved badly compared to the shark’ is an acceptable comment. It was awarded **1 mark**.

The final point on “the tall fin slid away and then the tail” suggesting he ‘changed his view’ and now sees the shark as ‘wonderful and elegant’ is an acceptable comment and was awarded **1 mark**.

Question 48: By referring to this poem and to at least one other poem by MacCaig, discuss how the poet uses the connection between people and place to explore central concerns.

The candidate was awarded **6 marks**.

Commonality

The candidate identifies areas of commonality by referring to *Basking Shark*, *Aunt Julia* and *Assisi*.

1 mark was awarded for the first point on the speaker's encounter with the shark to 'explore the theme of human nature.' NB there is no need when dealing with this poem to explicitly state the place as the ocean as this is taken as read.

0 marks were awarded for the comment on *Aunt Julia* as it does not connect her to a place.

The third point on *Assisi* is an acceptable comment on the theme of isolation linked to 'a beggar that sits outside the church.' It was awarded **1 mark**.

Extract

The first point is an acceptable comment on "He shoggled me" suggesting the speaker was 'physically' and 'internally moved' by the encounter, forcing him to think about humankind's evolution. It was awarded **1 mark**.

0 marks were awarded for the comment on "Swish up the dirt" as it is a misunderstanding.

Elsewhere

Aunt Julia

0 marks were awarded for the comment on "She was winds pouring wetly" because there is no reference to place.

0 marks were awarded for the point on "She was bucket and water" because the comment about 'her surroundings' is too vague.

0 marks were awarded for the comment on "crickets being friendly" as again there is no connection between Aunt Julia and place.

Assisi

The first point on “in honour of St Francis” suggesting the beggar being ignored whilst ‘outside a church’ showing ‘he is isolated from society’ is an acceptable comment. It was awarded **1 mark**.

The next point on “ruined temple” contrasting the beggar’s physical state to the grandeur of the church is an acceptable comment on the theme of isolation. It was awarded **1 mark**.

Aunt Julia

The point on ‘peat stained foot’ (as a result of her work) although it is a misquote is an acceptable comment as it demonstrates an implicit understanding of place linked to the central concern of nature. It was awarded **1 mark**.