

Commentary on candidate evidence

Candidate 1 – Part A: Historical Issues

The evidence for this candidate was placed within the following mark ranges for each question of this course assessment component.

Question 25: How important was the geographical position of Glasgow in explaining the rise of the Scottish tobacco trade during the eighteenth century?

Structure (overall structure, introduction and conclusion)

The candidate was awarded **credit in the 20-22 mark range** because the candidate uses relevant evidence to build an introduction which addresses the specific question asked. A line of argument is also presented: *‘The geographical location of Glasgow’s ports is said to have been of great benefit...yet it is also arguable that it was the illicit means by which Glasgow first found success.’*

Thoroughness/relevance of information and approach

The candidate was awarded **credit in the 20-22 mark range** because throughout the essay there is evidence of a fair quality of research demonstrating width and depth of knowledge. In addition, evidence is linked to points of analysis. The core concepts which relate to the question are given appropriate weight throughout. Well worked paragraphs using relevant evidence are a feature of the response. For example:

‘The aftermath of the Union is arguably a decisive factor as to why Scotland was able to push ahead in the tobacco trade. The Union had joined the Parliaments of England and Scotland, and as a result Scotland was now able to access the markets once dominated by the English which in turn bolstered their prosperity. Indeed, Devine states “the Union allowed them to push into a market that had for over a century been dominated by the English.”

Analysis, evaluation and line of argument

The candidate was awarded **credit in the 20-22 mark range** because the answer demonstrates an assured control of the arguments augmented by sound use of historiography:

‘Many would argue that the shorter crossing distance to Atlantic trading ports made it easier for them to get there quicker...However in terms of exporting it gave no such advantage and Devine argues that “geography did not play a role in pushing ahead of colonies in the European market.”

Historical sources/interpretations

The candidate was awarded **credit in the 20-22 mark range** because the candidate demonstrates awareness of differing interpretations amongst significant commentators and an ability to synthesise these interpretations including Smout, Devine and Whatley.

Candidate 1 – Part B: Historical Sources

The evidence for this candidate was placed within the following mark ranges for each question of this course assessment component.

Question 30: Evaluate the usefulness of Source A as evidence of the extent of support for the 1715 Rebellion.

The evidence demonstrates this candidate has achieved **10/12 marks** in their answer to this question.

Provenance

The candidate was awarded **1 mark** because the answer clearly contextualised the significance of the author, the Earl of Mar, as *'a prominent figure and indeed leader at the time of the rebellion'*.

Interpretation

The candidate was awarded **3 marks** because the answer repeatedly demonstrates a clear, logical interpretation of the content of the source identifying the main and significant view by demonstrating an understanding of the content. For example: *'The source says 'Highland Clans are rising to fight for their rightful king and country...meanwhile many of the lowland lords have also joined.' This means that there was a significant level of support for the rising from all over Scotland.'*

Wider contextual development

The candidate was awarded **4 marks** because the answer provides four detailed, developed points of recalled knowledge which is distinct from the information contained in the source, yet is relevant to the specific question asked. For example: *'the French had to withdraw their support due to the Treaty of Utrecht which meant the Jacobites lost the backing of one of their biggest allies.'*

Historical interpretations

The candidate was awarded **2 marks** because the answer features two accurate quotes from recognised historians which are relevant to the question asked. Note, despite a the candidate going on to reference Devine again and thus referencing historians three times, only 2 marks are available for Historical Interpretations.

Question 31: How much do Sources B and C reveal about differing interpretations of the impact of legislation following the 1745–1746 Rebellion?

The evidence demonstrates this candidate has achieved **12/16 marks** in their answer to this question.

Interpretation

The candidate was awarded **5 marks** because the answer repeatedly demonstrates a clear, logical interpretation of the content of the sources, identifying the main and significant view by demonstrating an understanding of the content. For example: *'the source mentions that 'any person wearing these items of clothing after the 1st of August 1747 who is convicted of this offence will be immediately imprisoned for six months'. This means that the Highlanders were now being punished for their culture and traditions which had now been outlawed.* The final point made by the candidate falls short of demonstrating accurate interpretation, hence no mark is awarded.

Wider contextual development

The candidate was awarded **5 marks** because the answer provides five detailed, developed points of recalled knowledge which is distinct from the information contained in the source, yet is relevant to the specific question asked; for example: *'The British Fisheries Society was a positive impact which supported the movement of Highlanders to coastal towns to boost the economy.'*

Historical interpretations

The candidate was awarded **2 marks**. Although the references are relatively brief, both Devine and MacInnes are recognised authorities on the topic and are accurately quoted with information relevant to the specific question asked.

Question 32: How fully does Source D explain the impact of eighteenth century educational reforms in Scotland?

The evidence demonstrates this candidate has achieved **5/12 marks** in their answer to this question.

A successful response should establish the partial nature of the information provided by introducing wider contextual development unfortunately missing in this response.

Interpretation

The candidate was awarded **3 marks** because the answer repeatedly demonstrates a clear, logical interpretation of the content of the source identifying the main and significant view by demonstrating an understanding of the content. For example: *'The source says 'considerable progress has been made in several lowland areas to achieve the ideal of a school in every parish'. This means that every parish in the lowlands now had a parish and as a result more children had access to education.'*

Wider contextual development

The candidate was awarded **1 mark** because the answer provides one detailed, developed points of recalled knowledge which is distinct from the information contained in the source, yet is relevant to the specific question asked: *'due to overcrowding in urban parish schools private vocational schools were established'*. Although the candidate does attempt to provide additional valid wider contextual development points, the answer drifts from the specific question asked as the candidate's response becomes hurried within a time controlled environment. A more successful response would establish the partial nature of the information provided by introducing wider contextual development unfortunately missing in this response.

Historical interpretations

The candidate was awarded **1 mark** because the answer features one accurate quote from recognised historians which is relevant to the question asked – Withrington is perhaps the most recognised expert in the field.