

Commentary on candidate 4 evidence (Field 2)

Title: How important was the part played by William Wallace in the Wars of Independence 1297-1305?

Word Count: 4365

Mark Awarded: 50 /50

Grade	Criteria	Comments
A+	Abstract/introduction Clarity of structure, areas, issues and line of argument	This comment is about the introduction without inclusion of the abstract here. There is a clear set up for the factors and line of argument. Historical opinion included. This is a clearly structured dissertation.
	Structure - conclusion(s)	Brought everything together to continue the line of argument throughout. There is some repetition in the mini conclusions across the chapters.
A++	Degree of THOROUGHNESS (depth and breadth)	Some of the post-1298 elements could have been clearer. However, what is covered is very detailed, going well beyond the most obvious points generally included in Wallace dissertations. Some nice details provided and well used in analysis – clear evidence of wide reading, width, and depth of understanding.
	Degree of relevance	Excellent.
A++	Degree of ANALYSIS and EVALUATION	Focused on the importance of Wallace and goes beyond the most obvious arguments of this period at multiple places across the dissertation. Some nice analysis of chronicles and of the long-term impacts Wallace had, rather than just his impact during his personal involvement in rebellion and government.
A++	Consideration of Historical sources /interpretations	The candidate engaged with a wide range of options for this topic, looking at much of what is available. Current historiography, particularly with Schoen Chronicle and Broun's article.
A++	Consideration of primary evidence	Uses multiple primary sources throughout the dissertation, embedded in the information being provided as well as implications and analysis.
A+	Footnoting and Bibliography	Consistent use of their chosen use of footnoting. Bibliography provided.
	Overall accuracy of approach	Excellent.