

# Commentary on candidate 1 evidence

The evidence for this candidate has achieved the following marks for each section of this course assessment component.

<b>Geographical Issue:</b> <i>The Impact and Sustainability of Cruise Liners.</i>			
Skills, KU	Commentary	Marks available	Marks awarded
A. Justification	<p>The candidate's justification includes information relating to:</p> <p>The <b>relevance</b> of the Issue in the wider context of the subject, with <b>explicit reference to literature</b> (Figures 1-3 and Guardian, 2015)</p> <p>The <b>purpose</b> of critically evaluating the Issue, 'An investigation into the social and environmental ...'</p>	4	4
B. Wider Reading	<p>The sources are relevant and current (Guardian 2017, New Yorker 2017 and Telegraph 2016).</p> <p>A reasonable range of viewpoints are demonstrated – Source 1 – environmental, Source 2 – social, Source 3 – environmental.</p> <p>The sources have been prioritised, albeit implicitly.</p> <p>There is reference to background reading 'Visitors have also brought ...as local crafts were sold'.</p> <p>The bibliography is not always reflected in the text.</p>	8	7
C. Summarise a range of viewpoints	<p>A reasonable range of viewpoints is demonstrated, although Sources 1 and 3 are similar.</p> <p>The organisation of summaries and evaluations could have been clearer – summary information was contained within the evaluations therefore markers had to look for information.</p> <p>There was a lack of citations provided.</p>	10	7
D. Critical evaluation	<p>There was evidence of explicit evaluative comments that included;</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>◆ credibility of author and publications</li> <li>◆ comparing and contrasting of viewpoints</li> <li>◆ examples from wider reading to support evaluative comments.</li> </ul> <p>'McVeigh points out ...'</p> <p>'Will Coldwell from the Guardian agrees ...'</p>	10	8

E. Conclusion	Key elements of the issue were summarised, supported by evidence, with all sources discussed.  The candidate provided an insightful last paragraph with an overall comment:  'New technology to create more sustainable ...'	8	7
<b>Total</b>		<b>40</b>	<b>33</b>

# Commentary on candidate 2 evidence

The evidence for this candidate has achieved the following marks for each section of this course assessment component.

<b>Geographical Issue:</b> <i>Does Scotland have the infrastructure to support the introduction of Electric Cars by 2032?</i>			
Skills, KU	Commentary	Marks available	Marks awarded
A. Justification	<p>The candidate's justification includes information relating to:</p> <p>The <b>relevance</b> of the Issue '<i>controversy the reinvention of Scottish infrastructure</i>', in the wider context of the Issue <b>/explicit reference to literature</b> '<i>the effects of climate change are irreversible</i>'; first paragraph.</p> <p>The <b>purpose</b> of critically evaluating the Issue '<i>to what extent ...electric cars by 2032</i>'; '<i>much controversy ...</i>'</p>	4	4
B. Wider Reading	<p>The sources are valid, relevant and current, with intellectual substance (Herald 2018, Transport Scotland 2018 and Leasing.com 2017), that provide a detailed review of the issue.</p> <p>There was evidence of prioritisation of sources /background reading.</p> <p>Wider reading was incorporated well.</p>	8	8
C. Summarise a range of viewpoints	<p>The candidate has identified and understood key information.</p> <p>A wide range of viewpoints have been summarised.</p> <p>Evidence of prioritisation of sources /background reading.</p> <p>Wider reading has been incorporated well.</p>	10	8

D. Critical evaluation	<p>Evidence was provided of explicit evaluative comments , with some insight, that included:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>◆ credibility of author/publication</li> <li>◆ comparisons between different viewpoints, ‘the report rebuts ...second paragraph)</li> <li>◆ ‘Suttie provides valid points ...to his arguments’</li> </ul>	10	8
E. Conclusion	<p>Key elements of the issue are summarised:</p> <p>All sources were mentioned and an overall judgment stated:  <i>‘the research suggests Scotland does not have the infrastructure’; ‘all the sources ...’</i></p> <p>A reasonable conclusion was provided, but was lacking in explicit evidence.</p>	8	4
<b>Total</b>		<b>40</b>	<b>32</b>